



**City and County of San Francisco
YOUTH COMMISSION
Transformative Justice Committee
Minutes – Draft**

**Monday, November 14th, 2022
5:00 p.m**

**Held via Videoconference
(remote public access provided via teleconference)**

Committee Membership Includes: Yoselin Colin (D9), Gabbie Listana (D6), Raven Shaw (Mayor), Tyrone Hillman (Mayor), Qien Feng (D3), Sahara Frett (Mayor)

Present: Yoselin Colin (D9), Gabbie Listana (D6), Raven Shaw (Mayor), Tyrone Hillman (Mayor), Qien Feng (D3)

Tardy: Tyrone Hillman (Mayor) - 5:38 pm

Absent: Sahara Frett

The San Francisco Youth Commission Transformative Justice Committee met remotely in regular session through videoconferencing, and provided public comment through teleconferencing, on Monday, November 14th, 2022, with Chair Yoselin Colin presiding.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call for Attendance

On the call of the roll:

Member	Present / Absent
Commissioner Colin	Present
Commissioner Listana	Present
Commissioner Shaw	Present
Commissioner Hillman	Tardy
Commissioner Feng	Present
Commissioner Frett	Absent



4 present
Quorum is met.

2. Communications

Alondra Esquivel Garcia, staff, provides communications.

3. Approval of Agenda (Action Item)

No discussion

No public comment.

Moved by Commissioner SHAW, seconded by Commissioner LISTANA to approve today's agenda.

On the motion to approve today's agenda:

Member	Present / Absent
Commissioner Colin	Aye
Commissioner Listana	Aye
Commissioner Shaw	Aye
Commissioner Hillman	Absent
Commissioner Feng	Aye
Commissioner Frett	Absent

4 ayes
This motion passes.

4. Approval of Minutes (Action Item)
a. June 14, 2021 (Packet Materials)

No discussion

No public comment.

Moved by Commissioner SHAW, seconded by Commissioner FENG to approve June 21st, 2021 Committee meeting minutes.



On the motion to approve the minutes for the June 21st, 2021 Committee meeting minutes:

Member	Present / Absent
Commissioner Colin	Aye
Commissioner Listana	Aye
Commissioner Shaw	Aye
Commissioner Hillman	Absent
Commissioner Feng	Aye
Commissioner Frett	Absent

4 ayes

This motion passes.

5. Public Comment on matters not on Today's Agenda (2 minutes per comment)

No public comment.

6. Conversation with Patricia Martinez, Youth Adult Justice Initiative

Commissioner Shaw moved to postpone conversation to the next scheduled meeting.
Seconded by Commissioner Feng.

On the motion to postpone conversation to the next scheduled meeting:

Member	Present / Absent
Commissioner Colin	Aye
Commissioner Listana	Aye
Commissioner Shaw	Aye
Commissioner Hillman	Aye
Commissioner Feng	Aye
Commissioner Frett	Absent

5 ayes

This motion passes.



7. Election of 2022-2023 Transformative Justice Committee Leadership (all items to follow are discussion & possible action)

- b. Discussion of Leadership Structure
- c. Election of Committee Leadership

Alondra Esquivel Garcia, staff, goes over possible leadership structures for the committee. TJ decides to have a Chair and Vice Chair as the leadership structure.

Election of Committee Chair/Vice Chair:

Commissioner Shaw nominates Commissioner Colin as Chair. Commissioner Colin accepts nomination.

Commissioner Colin has some brief remarks about her vision of the committee.

No questions or concerns for Commissioner Colin.

Commissioner Colin nominated Commissioner Shaw as Vice Chair. Commissioner Shaw accepts nomination.

Commissioner Shaw has brief remarks about her nomination as Vice Chair.

No questions or concerns for Commissioner Shaw. .

Motion for Leadership Structure of TJ to consist of Commissioner Colin as Chair and Commissioner Shaw as Vice Chair.

Member	Present / Absent
Commissioner Colin	Aye
Commissioner Listana	Aye
Commissioner Shaw	Aye
Commissioner Hillman	Aye
Commissioner Feng	Aye
Commissioner Frett	Absent



5 ayes

This motion passes.

8. Committee Business (all items to follow are discussion & possible action)

a. Team Building Activity

Commissioner Colin asked: Do you prefer in-person or online retreat?

In-person is preferred - Commissioner Feng

Weekend is preferred - Commissioner Listana

TJ Retreat will be from 10 am to 12 pm on Sunday, December 4th In-Person

9. Referred Legislation: BOS File No. 221093 - Hearing: Proactive Citywide Trauma Response to Gun Violence

Motion to support this hearing and send our remarks to the BOS Government Audit and Oversight Committee via Memo.

Moved by Commissioner Shaw. Seconded by Commissioner Hillman.

Member	Present / Absent
Commissioner Colin	Aye
Commissioner Listana	Aye
Commissioner Shaw	Aye
Commissioner Hillman	Aye
Commissioner Feng	Absent
Commissioner Frett	Absent

4 ayes

This motion passes.

10. Staff Report (discussion item)

No Staff Reports



11. Announcements (this includes Community Events)

Commissioner Colin shared some TJ related events to attend.

12. Adjournment

There is no further business. Meeting is adjourned at 6:09 PM.

[Stop Pretext Stops]

Resolution advocating for the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor of San Francisco to support the Coalition to End Biased Stops in San Francisco.

WHEREAS, Traffic stops are often racially biased, and are known as “driving, bicycling, or walking while Black or brown” or “pretext stops”; and

WHEREAS, Using racial profiling, police officers often stop individuals that pose little to no safety hazard in order to search for unrelated criminal offenses based on internalized racial biases; and

WHEREAS, Pretext stops funnel people of color into the criminal justice system causing communities of color to be further disproportionately harmed; and

WHEREAS, In 2021, the San Francisco Police Department conducted 27,543 stops that resulted in 6,003 searches, and the 5% Black population of San Francisco made up for 35% of all police searches; and

WHEREAS, SFPD, using the term “officer safety,” has searched Black San Franciscans 50% more than white San Franciscans with Bayview (a predominantly Black community) having the highest percentage of these stops; and

WHEREAS, The destructive legacy of pretext stops has led to the killings of innocent lives such as Sandra Bland (Texas), Philando Castile and Daunte Wright (Minnesota), and Walter Scott (South Carolina), to name a few, because of alleged traffic violations such as hanging a car air freshener, sleeping in their car, driving with a broken taillight, and riding a bike without headlights; and

WHEREAS; San Francisco mirrors the state and nation in over-policing communities of color via pretextual stops, with data showcasing that in 2021, SFPD stopped Black and brown people at least five times the rate of White people, searched Black and brown people at least eight times the rate of White people, and were thirteen times more likely to use force on Black and brown people than White people, despite Black and brown people being less likely to be found carrying contraband than White people; and

WHEREAS; SFPD 2021 traffic stop data shows that enforcing pretextual infractions has little demonstrable impact on reducing crime, has significant downsides in terms of the harassment and profiling of communities of color, especially BIPOC youth, and is a waste of taxpayer resources; and

WHEREAS; Miguel Bustos, Senior Director of GLIDE's Center for Social Justice, stated, "Many GLIDE clients have been harmed by racially-biased pretext stops and repeated harassment. Pretext stops further alienating some of our most marginalized neighbors and makes them feel as though they are not welcome in their own community. These negative interactions perpetrate physical, psychological, and financial harm; they inflict and reinforce trauma on our community, particularly communities of color"; and

WHEREAS; Sameena Usman, Senior Government Relations Coordinator for the Council on American-Islamic Relations-SFBA, said, "Pretext stops are an excuse to pull people over for simple things such as an item hanging from a rearview mirror or tinted

windows, and question, search, and even detain people. They do not help public safety and they disproportionately target communities of color, especially Black people”; and

WHEREAS; Avi Frey, Deputy Director, Criminal Justice Program, ACLU of Northern California, affirmed, “Pretext stops do nothing for public safety and routinely escalate into violence against Black and brown people. Their use is a constant reminder that the freedoms and lives of people of color are at the mercy of a government that views them as a suspect. It is past time to abolish this tool of racial oppression”; now, therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the 2022-2023 Youth Commission of the City and County of San Francisco urges the Mayor and Board of Supervisors to support legislation that confronts the issue of pretext stops by revising the Department General Order 9.01, which governs San Francisco traffic enforcement, to ensure San Francisco’s policies ban pretext stops; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That in revising DGO 9.01, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors place a limit on “low-level” vehicle stops, pedestrian, and bike stops; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That the city and county of San Francisco implement policies that also limit the search of other minor violations such as a broken tail light, windshield wiper, or a car air freshener; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That San Francisco follow other jurisdictions such as Los Angeles, Berkeley, and Cambridge who’ve already banned pretext stops in order to not become an outlier; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That the 2022-2023 Youth Commission of the City and County of San Francisco urges the Mayor and Board of Supervisors to publicly support Resolution NO. 2223-AL-05, in favor of ending biased stops in San Francisco.

RESOURCES:

1. <https://www.sfchronicle.com/projects/2022/california-racial-profiling-police-stops/>
2. <https://sfpublicdefender.org/news/2022/05/coalition-of-60-civil-rights-traffic-safety-and-community-groups-urging-san-francisco-police-commission-to-end-racially-biased-pretext-stops/>
3. <https://www.ppic.org/publication/racial-disparities-in-traffic-stops/>
4. <https://sf.gov/sites/default/files/2022-09/Supplemental%20Briefing%20Draft%20%28Oct.%206%20Meeting%29.pdf>
5. Presentation Slides