



City and County of San Francisco YOUTH COMMISSION

MINUTES

Monday, May 15, 2023
5:00 p.m.

IN-PERSON MEETING with REMOTE ACCESS

Members: Emily Nguyen (Chair, D11), Ewan Barker Plummer (Vice Chair, Mayoral), Steven Hum (Legislative Affairs Officer, Mayoral), Raven Shaw (Legislative Affairs Officer, Mayoral), Gabrielle Listana (Communications & Outreach Officer, D6), Astrid Utting (Communications & Outreach Officer, D8), Chloe Wong (D1), Allister Adair (D2), Reese Terrell (D3), Maureen Loftus (D4), Hayden Miller (D5), Ann Anish (D7), Yoselin Colin (D9), Vanessa Pimentel (D10), Yena Im (Mayoral), Tyrone S. Hillman III (Mayoral), Safiyyah Mirza (Mayoral).

Present: Emily Nguyen, Ewan Barker Plummer, Steven Hum, Raven Shaw, Astrid Utting, Chloe Wong, Allister Adair, Reese Terrell, Maureen Loftus, Hayden Miller, Yoselin Colin, Vanessa Pimentel, Tyrone S. Hillman III, Safiyyah Mirza.

Absent: Gabrielle Listana (unexcused), Ann Anish (excused), Yena Im (unexcused).

Tardy: None.

The San Francisco Youth Commission met in-person with remote access, and provided public comment through teleconferencing, on May 15, 2023, with Chair Nguyen presiding.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call for Attendance

Chair Nguyen called the meeting to order at 5:02pm.

On the call of the roll:

Roll Call Attendance: 15 present, 2 absent.

Chloe Wong present
Allister Adair present
Reese Terrell present



Maureen Loftus present
Hayden Miller present
Gabrielle Listana present
Ann Anish absent
Astrid Utting present
Yoselin Colin present
Vanessa Pimentel present
Ewan Barker Plummer present
Steven Hum present
Raven Shaw present
Yena Im absent
Tyrone S. Hillman III present
Safiyyah Mirza present
Emily Nguyen present

A quorum of the Commission was present.

Commissioner Colin, seconded by Commissioner Terrell, motioned to excuse Commissioner Anish. No public comment. The motion was carried by the following voice vote:

Voice vote: 15 ayes, 2 absent.

Chloe Wong aye
Allister Adair aye
Reese Terrell aye
Maureen Loftus aye
Hayden Miller aye
Gabrielle Listana aye
Ann Anish absent
Astrid Utting aye
Yoselin Colin aye
Vanessa Pimentel aye
Ewan Barker Plummer aye
Steven Hum aye
Raven Shaw aye
Yena Im absent
Tyrone S. Hillman III aye
Safiyyah Mirza aye
Emily Nguyen aye



Action: Commissioner Anish's absence excused.

2. Communications

Alondra Esquivel Garcia, Director of the SFYC, shared communications and meeting announcements with Commissioners.

3. Approval of Agenda (Action Item)

No discussion, and no public comment.

Commissioner Utting, seconded by Officer Colin, motioned to approve the May 15, 2023 full Youth Commission meeting agenda. No public comment. The motion carried by the following voice vote:

Voice Vote: 15 ayes, 2 absent.

Chloe Wong aye
Allister Adair aye
Reese Terrell aye
Maureen Loftus aye
Hayden Miller aye
Gabrielle Listana aye
Ann Anish absent
Astrid Utting aye
Yoselin Colin aye
Vanessa Pimentel aye
Ewan Barker Plummer aye
Steven Hum aye
Raven Shaw aye
Yena Im absent
Tyrone S. Hillman III aye
Safiyyah Mirza aye
Emily Nguyen aye

Action: Agenda Approved.

4. Approval of Minutes (Action Item)

a. May 1, 2023 (Packet Materials)

No discussion. No public comment.



Commissioner Colin, seconded by Vice Chair Barker Plummer, motioned to approve the May 1, 2023 full Youth Commission meeting minutes. No public comment. The motion carried by the following voice vote:

Voice Vote: 15 ayes, 2 absent

Chloe Wong aye
Allister Adair aye
Reese Terrell aye
Maureen Loftus aye
Hayden Miller aye
Gabrielle Listana aye
Ann Anish absent
Astrid Utting aye
Yoselin Colin aye
Vanessa Pimentel aye
Ewan Barker Plummer aye
Steven Hum aye
Raven Shaw aye
Yena Im absent
Tyrone S. Hillman III aye
Safiyyah Mirza aye
Emily Nguyen aye

Action: Minutes Approved.

5. Public Comment on matters not on Today's Agenda (2 minutes per comment)

No public comment.

6. Hearings (discussion and possible action)

a. Hearing to discuss and understand the current status of school safety policies, procedures, and infrastructure at San Francisco Unified School District school sites; and requesting the San Francisco Unified School District and San Francisco Police Department to report.

- i. Presenters: Gregory Markwith, SFUSD Admin; Hong Mei Pang, SFUSD Head of Communications and External Affairs; Arran Pera, SFPD Acting Commander; Delia Montiel, Community Violence Intervention Coordinator with SFPD Policy and Public Affairs.



Officer Utting emphasized that schools should be spaces for safe learning for youth, and clarified that the intent of this hearing is not about or encouraging the presence of police in schools. Vice Chair Barker Plummer made remarks about the need for safety in schools, and ensuring that young people, staff, and teachers are safe from gun violence. Vice Chair Barker Plummer also stated that he does not believe that police should return to school sites and hopes that this hearing will result in clarity in information about the status of school sites and how they can be made safer.

Hong Mei Pang, the SFUSD Head of Communication and External Affairs, made their presentation to the Youth Commission. Pang discussed the mission and values of the district, the school culture and climate that exists within the district, the available resources and services that the district provides to students, the district's readiness and safety planning, emergency response, the district's security matrix, and the district's coordination with the San Francisco Police Department.

Arran Pera, SFPD Acting Commander, and Delia Montiel, Community Violence Intervention Coordinator with SFPD Policy and Public Affairs, gave their presentation to the Youth Commission. Pera discussed details around SFUSD's decision to not renew the MOU (Memorandum of Understanding) with SFPD, the current relationship between SFUSD and SFPD as a liaison-based collaboration, and the extensive details of the preparation or emergency response to safety threats. Montiel discussed the SVRT (Street Violence Response Team) and their approach to deter at-risk youth through city departments, law enforcement, and both community- and faith-based organizations.

Vice Chair Barker Plummer asked both SFUSD and SFPD if the MOU included a school resource officer program or if it was inclusive of other policy understandings, to which Pera said it was both. Barker Plummer asked for the perspective if an MOU would create a better sense of collaboration, to which Pera said he thinks it would be a great idea, and Pang said that they still do communicate without the MOU and have a set of working guidelines in place. Gregory Markwith, the SFUSD Director of Planning, Preparedness & Prevention, added that SFUSD and SFPD still remain in regular communications to ensure that students' rights are being observed. Barker Plummer said it should be worth exploring to see what options would work best in the future.

Chair Nguyen asked why the SFUSD stopped having the School Resource Officer program in place and how effective the program was, to which Eric Guthertz, SFUSD Director of High Schools, said that with the change in the school board composition that the MOU was no longer an option to renew. Chair Nguyen pressed on why the SFUSD Board of Education decided to end the MOU, to which Guthertz said he can't speak as to why exactly, but it was to prevent students from being put in harm's way.



Officer Utting asked SFUSD about clarification on the timeline to modernize the PA systems and special lock devices for all schools in SFUSD, to which Markwith said that they're looking to complete the locks by Spring 2024, and are strategizing which sites will be prioritized to modernize the PA systems. Markwith added that there are 40 sites that need to be modernized in regard to the PA systems, and are assessing school sites to focus on updating their "A-phone" buzzer systems. Officer Utting asked what support SFUSD would need to expedite their process, to which Markwith said that the general bond will be on the ballot next year, and they can then use those funds if the bond does pass in the election. Markwith also said that he recognizes the frustration of how long these processes take and the extensive bureaucracy that is required due to it being a public city agency.

Officer Listana left the meeting at 6:01pm.

Commissioner Adair asked for clarity on the history of their responses to school-related threats, to which Pera said he can't comment on specifics but said most threats do not have merit. Adair asked about the process for when a threat does not have merit, to which Pera said that a report is filed and they communicate with the district on their conclusions.

Commissioner Miller asked about the root causes of youth violence and what initiatives that SFUSD is working on to prevent instances of crime from happening in the first place, to which Guthertz said that is exactly what they need to be focusing on, and said that the wellness centers are critical to addressing those problems. Guthertz added that working collectively & collaboratively with community-based organizations, and having case-by-case responses to best address students' direct basic needs by putting them in contact with resources and services that will best provide what they need. Miller asked about what support is in place for educators and school staff to be able to address issues around safety, to which Guthertz said that SFUSD provides similar resources and services to school staff to be able to address their issues as well. Miller asked SFUSD what their security strategy is since it can vary campus-to-campus, to which Guthertz said they intend to increase trainings for school security employees, increase more collaboration with CBOs to bring in violence interrupters, and other methods.

Commissioner Hillman asked if a new MOU would ensure a fast and effective response to emergency situations, to which Pang said that they have a strong enough system on their own, while also communicating with SFPD when needed.

Commissioner Wong asked what takes place when an incident happens and how to deal with the aftermath, to which Markwith said they have an established system to respond



to every type of situation at any school site, as well as doing a debrief after any response is needed through this emergency response process to improve in the future.

Commissioner Loftus asked if SFPD receives training in child psychology and de-escalating situations with youth, to which Pera said that they don't have specific trainings with younger children ages 12 or under.

Commissioner Pimentel asked if SFPD feels that they have adequate information about SFUSD schools to be able to respond to an active threat, to which Pera said that he can't speak for the precinct captains since they have the relationship with SFUSD. Pera clarified some information.

Commissioner Colin asked what SFPD's relationship is with students rather than school administration and teachers, to which Pera said that the relationship is good and usually isn't contentious. Commissioner Colin asked specifically if students would feel safe around police officers, to which Pera said that he can't speak for everyone but says it doesn't seem that they feel unsafe.

Officer Hum asked both SFUSD and SFPD what areas of improvement there are for methods of communication between both parties, to which Markwith says that the current relationship is good and that communication can only improve. Markwith says there's also more things that they'd wish to build back into their relationship with SFPD like student station visits.

Officer Shaw asked what the education looks like around these processes of emergency response and how familiar students are with the anonymous reporting system, to which Pang said that they maintain a family bulletin and regularly send out critical information that includes the many resources that they can use. Pang added that SFUSD also sends out bimonthly newsletters and practices lockdowns throughout the school year.

Vice Chair Barker Plummer asked about the significant delay in the implementation of school locks when the original date was January 2022 but has been delayed multiple times to now be fully completed in January 2024, to which Pang said that SFUSD operates a large number of schools and they have since expanded their scope of work and implementation of the previously mentioned safety systems. Vice Chair Barker Plummer emphasized that this is an important conversation to have and asked why the locks cannot be put in place over this summer for example, to which Pang said their public contracting and facility assessment processes take up a significant bulk of the reason for the repeated delays. Barker Plummer said that his first resolution was to push forward safe firearm storage information to families and asked what other plans SFUSD has to spread this information as a priority, to which Pang said that they appreciate that



there's information sharing and that there is a letter going out to families regarding this information.

Chair Nguyen asked SFUSD how they plan on destigmatizing access to health services and resources for youth since many youth of color don't feel safe accessing wellness centers at SFUSD schools, to which Pang said that there is a nationwide staff shortage for the needed qualifications to work in those positions.

Officer Utting asked how SFUSD plans on addressing the responses to the increase in youth violence, to which Markwith said there has been a reduction of situations that required the presence of police but said there is a strong continued need for more mental health services for students. Officer Utting asked if there would be a standardized plan to address these instances, to which Markwith said yes there is. Guthertz added that there's additional data that help improve their efficacy in their responses.

Commissioner Miller asked how SFUSD is ensuring that students are educated on their rights in the classroom especially when dealing with law enforcement, to which Pang said that the Student Advisory Council has been working to uplift SFUSD students by better embedding those rights into school programming. Miller added that it would be great for those further conversations to happen, especially directly from SFUSD itself. Pang added that SFUSD is hoping to soon launch a public service campaign to reaffirm students' rights, and would be interested in partnering with the Youth Commission in the future.

Public Comment:

Speaker 1 (Celeste Perron): She thanked Commissioner Barker Plummer and Commissioner Utting showed a painting of a young person painting a young student hiding under the desk with a gun pointed at them, and next to their friend who was shot in school. She is glad that SFUSD is moving forward to provide better safety measures, but wants them to send more information directly to families. Part of Moms Demand Action.

Speaker 2 (Chrissy Rivera): She has children who attend SFUSD, and thanked the Youth Commission for speaking on these issues. She said that her children have witnessed multiple incidents at school and that the issue is very real for young people in SFUSD. She is afraid that her children will be involved in more incidents if nothing is done. Part of Moms Demand Action.

Speaker 3 (Tarah P.): She thanked the Youth Commission and Commissioner Barker Plummer, and said that she hopes SFUSD will send letters home to every



family in the school district at the beginning of each school year. Part of Moms Demand Action.

Speaker 4 (Cindy Shuserman): She is a resident of the Sunset and she's a public school teacher. She said 60 calls each year is too many with too many lives at stake. She recommends that in addition to letters being sent home, there should be in-person signage, group meetings, and other ways of letting youth know about how to stay safe. She said that she has imagined the choice of having to sacrifice her life for her students, and that the reality of school shootings happening is daily. She wants to see change. Part of Moms Demand Action.

Speaker 5 (unknown): She thanked the Youth Commission for discussing this issue, and is the parent of two young children in SF. Part of Moms Demand Action.

Vice Chair Barker Plummer made final remarks thanking everyone for being there, and hopes that there can be a future where students in school truly feel safe. Officer Utting agreed and hopes that these conversations can still continue to move forward.

7. Chinese Community Health Resource Center Asian American Public Health Youth Leadership Academy Partnership (discussion and possible action)

a. Presenter: YC Staff

Director Garcia gave an explanation of what this partnership would look like, which would include hosting their cohort in City Hall and explaining what work the Youth Commission has been doing this year.

Commissioner Miller asked about the final approval for this partnership, to which Director Garcia said that the Executive Committee gave preliminary approval.

No public comment.

Officer Utting, seconded by Vice Chair Barker Plummer, motioned to approve the partnership with the Asian American Public Health Youth Leadership Academy. The motion carried by the following voice vote:

Voice Vote: 15 ayes, 2 absent

Chloe Wong aye
Allister Adair aye
Reese Terrell aye



Maureen Loftus aye
Hayden Miller aye
Gabrielle Listana aye
Ann Anish absent
Astrid Utting aye
Yoselin Colin aye
Vanessa Pimentel aye
Ewan Barker Plummer aye
Steven Hum aye
Raven Shaw aye
Yena Im absent
Tyrone S. Hillman III aye
Safiyah Mirza aye
Emily Nguyen aye

Action: partnership approved.

8. Staff Report (discussion item)

Director Esquivel Garcia said she'll be emailing out most of her report, she apologized for the quick turnaround to approve the Asian American Public Health Youth Leadership Academy's partnership but said that they can attend a SFYC meeting to explain the resources and services that they provide. Director Garcia also asked Commissioners to reach out to staff if they want to submit a leave of absence during the summer, and thanked those who did reach out to her. Lastly, Director Garcia said she is working to try and get in-person tours for TAY housing in District 9, and that she'll be sure to update the Commission once that tour has been scheduled.

Commissioner Loftus asked if there was any difference between excusing absences and the letter of absence, to which Director Garcia clarified the attendance policy.

Specialist Zhan had no report. Specialist Ochoa said that he's working on recruitment efforts to different organizations to encourage youth to apply for the 2023/2024 YC, and reminded Commissioners to distribute the flyers he gave out at the beginning of the meeting.

No public comment.

9. Announcements (this includes Community Events)

No announcements. No public comment.



10. Adjournment

There being no further business on the agenda, the full Youth Commission adjourned at 7:05pm.

May 15th, 2023

To Whom It May Concern

Re: School Safety

Hello,

I am a public school teacher and have been a part of SFUSD for the past 7 years. Over this time, I have seen the District face and address many challenges. The current reality of our school district safety is staggering.

While there are many issues that present themselves in this conversation, I'd like to focus on one specific problem. Teachers, when the victim of threats or violence, have little recourse in the current system. I myself had an obsessive student (the District's term, not mine) who scheduled my execution. When I was made aware of this, I was forced to use my remaining PTO days, and then go on unpaid leave while the District looked into this issue. The only resolution available to me was to leave my school site and transfer to another. Doing so ensured that I would not be exposed to the individual who threatened me, however, students at the school remain exposed to the student. The District was both unable and unwilling to take any actions to ensure my safety and the safety of others. Additionally, I am forced to use my personal days, and then go unpaid, while this is being resolved.

What I am asking for is that the District clarify procedures and expectations for staff who experience threats from students. I was left negotiating a complicated path, with little guidance. If SFUSD hopes to attract and retain teachers, there needs to be clear support in place for those who are the victims of violent threats and actions in the workplace.

Regards,

Michael Adkins
SFUSD middle school teacher