



City and County of San Francisco

Sunshine Ordinance Task Force

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place,
Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689
(415) 554-7724

Meeting Minutes

Members:

Seat 1	Dean Schmidt	Seat 7	Matthew Yankee - Chair
Seat 2	Lila LaHood	Seat 8	Chris Hyland
Seat 3	Saul Sugarman	Seat 9	David Pilpel
Seat 4	Ankita Kumar	Seat 10	Joe Sangirardi
Seat 5	Maxine Anderson	Seat 11	Bruce Wolfe
Seat 6	Laura Stein - Vice-Chair		
Ex-officio	<i>(non-voting)</i> Clerk of the Board of Supervisors or their designee		
Ex-officio	<i>(non-voting)</i> Michael Adams, Mayor's designee		

Clerk: Victor Young
sotf@sfgov.org

**Wednesday, March 4,
2026**

**4:00 p.m.
Regular Meeting**

City Hall, Room 408

1. **CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND AGENDA CHANGES (00:01:08)**

The meeting was called to order at 4:01 p.m. On the call of the roll, Chair Yankee, Vice-Chair Stein, and Members Schmidt, Sugarman, Kumar, Anderson, Hyland, Sangirardi, and Wolfe were noted present. Members LaHood and Pilpel were noted absent. Deputy City Attorney Jose Zelidon was noted present. Ex-officio Member Adams was noted present. Administrator Victor Young was present. There was a quorum.

Chair Yankee noted the following:

- Item 16 has been continued to the April 1, 2026 meeting after both parties reached an agreement after the posting of the March 2, 2026 agenda.
- Item 19 will be taken out of order after item 15.

Public Comment: None.

No Actions Taken.

2. **Welcome New Task Force Member and Introductory Remarks (00:04:47)**

Member Joe Sangirardi introduced himself, provided his background and described his desire to serve.

Public Comment: None.

No Action Taken.

3. **Approval of the February 4, 2026 Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Regular meeting minutes. (00:08:07)**

The members discussed the draft minutes.

Action: Moved by Member Anderson, seconded by Member Wolfe, to approve the February 4, 2026 minutes.

Public Comment: None.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Anderson, Wolfe, Schmidt, Sugarman, Kumar, Hyland, Sangirardi, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Pilpel

4. **Approval of Orders of Determination(00:10:06)**

- **File No. 25075** Jared Stratton v. San Francisco Police Department
- **File Nos. 25082-1 and 25085-2** Michael J. Turon v. San Francisco Planning Department, Chan Son and Hugo Cabrera
- **File No. 25100** Concerned San Francisco Residents v. Department of Public Health
- **File No. 25128** Mark LaCroix against San Francisco Fire Commission
- **File No. 25130** Patrick Monette-Shaw against Commission Streamlining Task Force, Ed Harrington, Sophia Kittler, and DCA Jon Givner
- **File No. 25133** Michael Petrelis against Office of the Mayor

Action: Moved by Member Wolfe, seconded by Member Hyland, to approve the Orders of Determination, pursuant to any changes made to the relevant meeting minutes.

Public Comment: None.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 - Wolfe, Hyland, Schmidt, Sugarman, Kumar, Anderson, Sangirardi, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Pilpel

Member LaHood was noted present at 4:22 p.m.

5. **Hearing on Proposed Amendments to the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force By-Laws:** Review and discuss amendments proposed by the Complaint Committee and any other amendments proposed by SOTF Members to reduce the length of SOTF meetings. (00:13:08)

The members discussed the proposed amendments to the Task Force By-Laws.

Public Comment: None.

No Actions Taken.

6. **Commission Streamlining Task Force Update:** Review recommendations from the Commission Streamlining Task Force (CSTF) and its staff which may affect the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force (SOTF), and potentially take action to communicate suggestions or concerns from the SOTF to the Board of Supervisors. (00:33:44)

The members discussed Commission Streamlining Task Force recommendations and future actions. The SOTF requested Chair Yankee reach out to inquire about the Streamlining Task Force decision regarding the Downtown Revitalization Financing District.

Public Comment: Patrick Monette-Shaw commented on the timeline for action of Streamlining Task Force and retention of records as all documents appear to be stored via hyperlinks.

No Action was Taken.

Member Kumar note absent at 8:07 p.m. and for the remainder of the meeting.

7. **Chair and Committee Reports:** Opportunity for the Chair and Committee Chairs to update the entire Sunshine Ordinance Task Force on their recent activities. (04:06:56)

SOTF Chair Yankee, Complaint Committee Chair Schmidt, EOTC Chair Hyland, and Compliance and Amendments Committee Chair LaHood provided updates. Deputy City Attorney (DCA) Zelidon stated that DCA Robb Kapla will be replacing DCA Adam Shapiro as one of the DCAs assigned to the SOTF.

Public Comment: None

No action taken.

8. **Administrator's Report.** (04:16:20)

- Task Force and Committee tentative hearing schedule with potential adjustments
- Complaints and Hearing Requests
- Pending Petitions / Complaints
- SOTF Member Attendance
- Communications

The Task Force discussed the Administrator's report, Member Wolfe's out-of-town schedule, adding metrics to distinguish between matters awaiting supporting documentation versus files ready for an initial hearing, matters awaiting a compliance hearing, and the status of any other outstanding matters.

Public Comment: None.

No action taken.

9. **Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction but not on today's agenda. (01:06:00)

Michael Turon commented on his July 31, 2025 complaint, provided a summary and requested an update.

CONSENT AGENDA – Items 10 through 14 (01:10:28)

10. **File No. 25087:** Complaint filed by Anonymous (GRA) against Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner.

(On 1/27/2026, the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the SOTF's Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find a violation of Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21(a), by failing to permit the inspection of public records during normal hours of operation, Section(s) 67.21(b), by failing to

produce public records within ten days, and Section 67.21(c), by failing to assist a requestor in identifying public records, and referred the matter to a committee for compliance. Respondent is ordered to provide records within five (5) business days on a timeline of a rolling list, with all to be delivered in 20 business days.)

11. **File No. 25134:** Complaint filed by Minh Cantarutti against Homeless and Supportive Housing for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. *(On 1/27/2026, the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and forwarded the matter to the SOTF's Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find a violation Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner; Section(s) 67.26, by failing to keep withholdings to a minimum, and Section(s) 67.27, by failing to provide written justification of withholdings.)*
12. **File No. 26011:** Complaint filed by HVSafe against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner and 67.25, by failing to respond to an immediate disclosure request in a timely and/or complete manner. *(On 2/17/2026, the Complaint Committee found that that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the SOTF's Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find that the SFMTA violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21(b). The Committee found that the SFMTA did respond to the Immediate Disclosure Request but not in a complete manner and therefore found no violation of Section 67.25.)*
13. **File No. 26016:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. *(On 2/17/2026, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and forwarded the matter to the SOTF's Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find no violation since the records requested are exempt under CA Government Code Section 7927.700.)*

14. **File No. 26017:** Complaint filed by Michael Petrelis against the Office of the Mayor for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.29-5, by failing to respond to a request for Proposition G calendar in a complete manner.

(On 2/17/2026, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and forwarded the matter to the SOTF's Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find no violation. The Committee found that the Mayor's Office did not violate the Prop G rules in listing that the Castro theater stakeholders were at a meeting rather than listing each individual because Section 67.29-5 requires that calendar entries identify the individuals present and organization represented at a meeting or event only if the meeting has 10 or fewer attendees. The Committee also found that the Mayor's Office satisfied the law by acting in good faith by providing the full list of attendees as required by Section 67.29-5(e).)

Member Wolfe requested that Item Nos. 13 and 14 be severed from the consent agenda.

Action: Moved by Member Hyland seconded by Member Wolfe, to adopt the Consent Agenda (Items 10, 11, and 12) and adopt the recommendations of the Committee(s).

Public Comment: Speaker commented on Item 11 and stated that a good faith effort was not provided and requested accountability.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 10 – Hyland, Wolfe, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Kumar, Anderson, Sangirardi, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 – Pilpel

Action: Moved by Member Hyland, seconded by Member Wolfe, to Continue Items No. 13 and 14 to the April 1, 2026, SOTF meeting.

Member Hyland withdrew the motion.

Action: Moved by Vice Chair Stein, seconded by Member Anderson, to adopt Consent Agenda Item 13 (File No. 26016) and adopt the recommendations of the Committee.

Public Comment: None.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Kumar, Anderson, Hyland, Sangirardi, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 1 – Wolfe

Absent: 1 – Pilpel

Action: Moved by Member Sugarman, seconded by Member Kumar, to adopt Consent Agenda Item 14 (File No. 26017) and adopt the recommendations of the Committee.

Public Comment: None.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Sugarman, Kumar, Schmidt, LaHood, Anderson, Hyland, Sangirardi, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 1 – Wolfe

Absent: 1 – Pilpel

REQUEST FOR RECONSIDERATION – *Item 15* (01:31:34)

15. **File No. 25130:** Complaint filed by Patrick Monette-Shaw against the Commission Streamlining Task Force, Ed Harrington, Sophia Kittler and Deputy City Attorney Jon Givner for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.7, by failing to post an agenda at least 72 hours before a regular meeting containing a meaningful description of each item of business to be transacted or discussed at the meeting. ([attachment](#))

(On 1/20/2026, the Complaint Committee found that this is a public meeting under the Task Force's jurisdiction and forwarded the matter to the full Task Force for consideration.

On 2/4/2026, the Task Force found that the Commission Streamlining Task Force violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.6(f), and California Government Code (Brown Act) Section 54956(a), by failing to adequately describe possible actions for an item on the agenda and for taking action on that item at the same meeting.

On 2/20/2026, Patrick Monette-Shaw submitted a timely Request for Reconsideration.)

The Task Force discussed the request for reconsideration.

Action: Moved by Vice Chair Stein, seconded by Member Sangirardi, to not grant the request for reconsideration.

Public Comment: Patrick Monette-Shaw (Petitioner) stated he did not prepare a statement regarding the matter and requested an opportunity to summarize his position.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 7 – Stein, Sangirardi, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Kumar, Yankee

Noes: 3 – Anderson, Hyland, Wolfe

Absent: 1 – Pilpel

The meeting recessed at 5:45 pm and reconvened at 6:00 pm.

Member Michael Adams was noted absent at 6:00 p.m. and for the remainder of the meeting.

COMPLAINT HEARING AGENDA – Items 16 through 19

16. **File No. 25028:** Complaint filed Anmarie against the Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.5 by failing to hold open meetings, 67.7 by failing to post an agenda, 67.15 by failing to allow public testimony, and 67.16 by failing to record and post minutes of regular and special meetings of the board or commission. (02:45:41)

(On 5/20/2025, the Complaint Committee referred the matter to the full Task Force for consideration of whether there is a violation of Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.21 for failing to produce public records.

On 7/2/2025, the Task Force continued the matter to the call of the Chair.

On 8/6/2025, the Task Force found that the Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco (FAMSF) violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance) Section 67.21. by failing and refusing to seek and produce the requested documents and ordered that they do so. In addition, the Task Force found that the attendance by a majority the FAMSF trustees at meetings of the Corporation of the Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco implicates Section 67.3(b) and thus those are public meetings and the meetings proffered by Petitioner were done in violation of Section 67.5 by failing to hold open and public meetings, Section 67.7 by failing to post an agenda with a meaningful description of each item to be transacted or discussed at the meeting, Section 67.15 by failing to provide an opportunity for members of the public to directly address a policy body on items of interest to the public that are within the policy body's subject matter jurisdiction, and Section 67.16 by failing to record the minutes for each regular and special meeting of the

board or commission. The matter was referred to a Committee for compliance and follow up.

On 9/3/2025, the Task Force approved the Order of Determination as amended.

On 10/15/2025, the Task Force continued the matter for compliance to the call of the Chair.

On 11/25/2025, the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee meeting was cancelled due to the lack of a quorum.

On 12/30/2026, the Compliance and Amendments Committee referred the matter to the full Task Force, noting that no changes in the production of records have occurred since the Order of Determination.)

The parties agreed to continue the matter to April 1, 2026, prior to the meeting. The request was automatically granted pursuant to SOTF Complaint Procedure.

17. **File No. 25033:** Joudere Gaines against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (02:47:48)

(On 9/23/2025, the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee continued and forwarded the matter to the Complaint Committee and asked that the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency provide a point-by-point response to each of the requested listed in NR-24-6646 located on pages 3-8 of the meeting packet.

On 11/18/2025, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the full Task Force with no recommendation.

On 12/3/2025, the Task Force closed the matter per SOTF Complaint Procedure C(7)(b).

On 12/4/2025, Petitioner submitted a timely request to reopen the file under Section C(7)(b).)

Joudere Gaines (Petitioner) presented their position and requested the Task Force to find violations. Mr. Gaines commented on the inadequacy of the documents provided and documents provided not relevant to the request. Mr. Gaines stated that certain request records have not yet been provided. Mr. Gaines stated that records provided should have indicated which question they were responsive to.

Carolyn Celeya, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (Respondent) provided an overview of the department's position. Ms. Celeya stated that it was unclear to determine if the multiply request was in question but made efforts to provide requested documents, indicate withheld documents and/or state if there were no responsive records. Ms. Celeya stated the response do not need to be itemized as document can be provided on a rolling basis.

A question-and-answer period occurred. The parties were provided an opportunity for rebuttals.

Upon discussion the SOTF indicated that Petitioner request item 6 may have not been addressed.

Action: Moved by Chair Yankee, seconded by Member Sangirardi, to continue the matter to April 1, 2026 meeting of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force to determine the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's compliance specific to Item 6 of Petitioner's records request.

Public Comment: None.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 10 – Yankee, Sangirardi, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Kumar, Anderson, Hyland, Wolfe, Stein

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 – Pilpel

Member Pilpel was noted present at 7:27 p.m.

18. **File No. 26002:** Complaint filed by Charles Denny against San Francisco Police Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner, 67.26, by failing to keep withholdings to a minimum, and 67.27, by failing to provide written justification of withholdings. (03:26.26)

(On 1/20/2026, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the full Task Force for consideration. The Committee made no recommendations but noted that the Task Force should consider its determinations, among other possible violations, Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21(c), by failing to assist a requestor in identifying public records, and Section(s) 67.22(a), by failing to provide information to the public about its operations.)

Charles Denny (Petitioner) presented their position and requested the Task Force to find violations. Mr. Denny stated the request was not related to investigative activities or specific cases but instead for was for administrative records. Mr. Denny stated the Police Department did not attempt to provide assistance to identify files.

Sgt. Rich Cibotti, Police Department (Respondent) provided an overview of the department's position. Sgt. Cibotti stated the department responded to the request in a timely manner and the Petitioner did not identify specific records. Sgt. Cibotti stated that the department is not required to respond to interrogatory/questions.

A question-and-answer period occurred. The parties were provided an opportunity for rebuttals.

Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Anderson, to find that the San Francisco Police Department violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21(c), by failing to provide public records in a timely and/or complete manner. The Task Force orders the Police Department provide a response pursuant to California Government Code Sections 7922.700 thru 7922-725 in regards to describing the systems used to track Homicide Division investigative case files. The Task Force further refers the matter to a Task Force Committee to monitor compliance.

Public Comment: None.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 11 – Pilpel, Anderson, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Kumar, Hyland, Sangirardi, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

19. **File No. 26015:** Complaint filed by Jason Gibbs against the San Francisco Library Commission for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.15, by failing to allow public comment for up to three minutes. (02:00:25)

(On 2/17/2026, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction and forwarded the matter to the full Task Force for consideration, with no recommendation.)

Jason Gibbs (Petitioner) presented their position and requested the Task Force to find violations. Mr. Gibbs noted previous court decision regarding the public comment time limits (Chaffe vs. the Public Library Commission). Mr. Gibbs noted that the decision to reduce the time limits are arbitrary and not based on the length of the meeting.

Margo Shaw, Public Library Commission (Respondent) provided an overview of the department's position. Ms. Shaw stated that it is at the discretion of the Commission to determine public comment time limits as long as it is applied uniformly.

A question-and-answer period occurred. The parties were provided an opportunity for rebuttals.

Action: Moved by Member Wolfe, seconded by Member Kumar, to find that the San Francisco Public Library Commission violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.15(c), by failing to provide up to three minutes for public comment on each agenda item absent a clear reason to reduce speaker time for cause.

The SOTF urges the Library Commission to provide justification when reducing speaker time below three minutes.

Public Comment: None.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 7 - Wolfe, Kumar, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 3 - Schmidt, Hyland, Sangirardi

Absent: 1 - Pilpel

20. **Hearing on Sunshine Ordinance Amendments:** Discussion and potential action regarding proposed amendments to the Sunshine Ordinance. (04:25:00)

The Task Force discussed proposed amendments to the Sunshine Ordinance. The Task Force noted the following issues should be addressed:

- Getting assistance/sponsorship to bring amendments to the voters.
- Clarifying public comment limits.
- Addressing records retentions for sunseting boards/commissions.
- Possible Amendment to title of next Agenda listing
- Lobby Supervisors for assistance
- Get timeline for getting onto election

Public Comment: None

No actions taken.

21. **2025 Annual Report of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force:** Review and approve the 2025 Annual Report. (04:54:48)

Members of the public can view these documents online (no password or identification required) or review the printed versions in the agenda packet. Public comments on these documents can be sent directly to lstein.sotf@gmail.com or made during public comment on this agenda item.

2025 Annual Report Links:

[Annual Report 2025 Documents Folder \(Main Folder\)](#)

All files can be found in this folder.

[Draft 2025 Annual Report Proposal](#)

[Draft 2025 Annual Report](#)

Data Utilized:

[Survey Form](#)

[Sunshine Ordinance Survey Responses Raw Data](#)

[Sunshine Ordinance Survey Responses Cleaned for Analysis](#)

[Complaint Resolution Data](#)

[NextRequest Report](#)

The Task Force discussed the proposed 2025 SOTF Annual Report.

Action: Moved by Member Wolfe, seconded by Member Anderson, approve the SOTF 2025 Annual Report.

Public Comment: None.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 10 – Wolfe, Anderson, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Hyland, Pilpel, Sangirardi, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 – Kumar

Public Comment: None

22. **Announcements, Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items by Members of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.** (05:09:53)

Member Wolfe noted the Department of Technology Redaction Technology would attend the April SOTF meeting and discuss the redaction software and commented on committee process standards that minutes should be available before an SOTF hearing. Vice-Chair Stein commented on an educational event called the Future of Independent Commissions in San Francisco, responding to the recommendations of the Commission Streamlining Task Force.

Public Comment: None

23. **ADJOURNMENT** (05:14:23)

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 9:15 p.m.

APPROVED: _____
Sunshine Ordinance Task Force

N.b. the Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.

