



City and County of San Francisco

Sunshine Ordinance Task Force

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place,
Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Meeting Minutes

Members:

Seat 1	Dean Schmidt	Seat 7	Matthew Yankee - Chair
Seat 2	Lila LaHood	Seat 8	Chris Hyland
Seat 3	Saul Sugarman	Seat 9	David Pilpel
Seat 4	Ankita Kumar	Seat 10	VACANT
Seat 5	Maxine Anderson	Seat 11	Bruce Wolfe
Seat 6	Laura Stein - Vice-Chair		
Ex-officio	(non-voting) Clerk of the Board of Supervisors or their designee		
Ex-officio	(non-voting) Michael Adams, Mayor's designee		

Clerk: Patricia Petersen
(415) 554-7719 ~ patricia.petersen@sfgov.org

**Wednesday, December 3,
2025**

**4:00 p.m.
Regular Meeting**

City Hall, Room 408

1. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND AGENDA CHANGES (00:00:59)

Chair Yankee called the meeting to order at 4:09 p.m. On the call of the roll Chair Yankee, Vice-Chair Stein and Members Schmidt, Sugarman, Anderson, Hyland, Pilpel and Wolfe were noted present. Members LaHood and Kumar were noted absent. Ex-officio Member Michael Adams was noted present. A quorum was present. Deputy City Attorney Valerie Lopez was noted absent. Administrator Pat Petersen was present.

Public Comment: None

2. Approval of the November 5, 2025 Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Regular Meeting minutes. (00:03:17)

4:14 p.m. Deputy City Attorney Valerie Lopez was noted present.

4:17 p.m. Member Lila LaHood was noted present.

The members discussed amendments to the draft minutes.

Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Wolfe, to approve the November 5, 2025 Minutes as amended.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Pilpel, Wolfe, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Hyland, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 1 - Kumar

3. **Approval of Orders of Determination (00:14:45)**

- **File No. 23085** Mike Spencer against the District Attorney
- **File No. 24015** Paul Kniha against the Municipal Transportation Agency
- **File No. 25057** Annie Gilbertson against the San Francisco Police Department
- **File No. 25074** Patrick Monette-Shaw against Department of Public Health
- **File No. 25077** Chikodi Chima against the Human Services Agency

Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Vice-Chair Stein, to conform the content of the Orders of Determination in accordance with the edits to the approved November 5, 2025 Regular Meeting Minutes of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, and to approve the Orders of Determination as amended.

Public Comment: Toni Battle, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Ombudsperson, provided the agency's position. Ms. Battle further stated that re File 24015 there were 15 responsive records asserting the mediation confidentiality privilege and that attorney/client redactions were not addressed.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Pilpel, Stein, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Hyland, Wolfe, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 1 – Kumar

4. **Annual Supervisor of Records Report from the City Attorney's Office:** Review and potential acceptance of the annual report for calendar year 2024. (00:21:54)

Alex Barrett-Shorter, Deputy Press Secretary, presented the report.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

Action: Moved by Member Anderson, seconded by Member LaHood, to accept the Annual Supervisor of Records Report from the City Attorney's office for calendar Year 2024.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Anderson, LaHood, Schmidt, Sugarman, Hyland, Pilpel, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 1 – Kumar

5. **Commission Streamlining Task Force Update:** Review recommendations from the Commission Streamlining Task Force (CSTF) and its staff which may affect the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force (SOTF), and potentially take action to communicate suggestions or concerns from the SOTF to the CSTF. (00:31:33)

The members discussed the role of journalists on the Task Force for transparency in government, their support for continuing the current process for selecting the membership, and the importance of retaining the disabled and Society of Professional Journalist seats. The members further discussed the classification of the Task Force, whether it is regulatory or advisory, and that it is a compliance body.

Public Comment: Aaron Wilson stated that the Task Force is important as a regulating body with the ability to issue orders and hopefully have them complied with by the departments. Mr. Wilson further stated that the body needs to be made up of the types of people who are on the Task Force now and that a 12-year term is enough.

No action taken.

6. **Administrator's Report.** (04:00:09)

- Task Force and Committee tentative hearing schedule with potential adjustments
- Complaints and Hearing Requests
- Pending Petitions / Complaints
- SOTF Member Attendance
- Communications

The Administrator presented the report.

Public Comment: Aaron Wilson stated his appreciation for the Task Force.

No action taken.

7. **Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction but not on today's agenda. (01:22:21)

None.

CONSENT AGENDA – *Item 8*

The Sunshine Ordinance Task Force shall review **File No. 25080** to affirm the Committee's findings regarding the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force's jurisdiction; violations of the Sunshine Ordinance, Brown Act, or California Public Records Act; and, if applicable, to issue an Order of Determination and refer matters to a Committee for monitoring. The Complainant and Respondent are *not required to attend the December 3, 2025 Sunshine Ordinance Task Force meeting* but may attend to provide testimony during the public comment period for this item related to the determinations listed below.

8. **File No. 25080 (25-6968):** Complaint filed by Aaron Wilson against San Francisco Animal Care & Control for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.26, by failing to keep withholdings to a minimum, and Section 67.27, by failing to provide written justification of withholdings. (01:23:38)

DCA Valerie Lopez stated that with all members of the Complaint Committee present, the item was agendized correctly and could proceed before the Task Force.

Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Schmidt, to continue File No. 25080 to the January 7, 2026 Regular Meeting of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force and include on the Consent Agenda an explanatory statement of the action taken by the Complaint Committee at its November 18, 2025 Regular Meeting.

Public Comment: Aaron Wilson supported the continuance.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Pilpel, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Hyland, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 1 – Kumar

The Task Force was in recess from 5:44 p.m. until 5:56. Member Hyland was noted absent and returned at 6:10 p.m.

COMPLAINT HEARING AGENDA – *Items 9 through 11*

9. **File No. 25063:** Complaint filed by Hanley Chan against the Department of Technology for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25 by failing to respond by failing to respond to an immediate disclosure request in a timely and/or complete manner. (01:47:27)

(On 10/15/2025, the Task Force found that it has jurisdiction in the matter and found that the Department of Technology violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.25, by failing to respond to an immediate disclosure request in a timely and/or complete manner. The Respondent is to provide a written response by 11/19/2025 explaining why the department feels it is neither the custodian nor in custody of the requested records as described by the Sunshine Ordinance.)

Hanley Chan (Petitioner) was not present.

Karen Hong, Chief of Staff and Custodian of Records (Respondent) requested a reconsideration of the Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.25, violation based on new findings, and stated that the supporting documents have been provided from the Committee on Information Technology which defines the roles that the department has in terms of data, which is that the department is the holder of the email records that are responsive to a request.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

Action: Moved by Member Schmidt, seconded by Vice-Chair Stein, to find that the Department of Technology violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25 by failing to respond to in immediate disclosure request in a timely and/or complete manner. The Task Force further ordered the production of the requested records per Section(s) 67.21 and referred the matter to a Committee for follow-up.

Public Comment: Aaron Wilson stated that he believes that the Department of Technology's policy is a workaround of the Sunshine Ordinance and that if this is allowed to occur then transparency is compromised.

The motion **FAILED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 5 – Schmidt, Stein, LaHood, Hyland, Wolfe

Noes: 4 – Sugarman, Anderson, Pilpel, Yankee

Absent: 1 - Kumar

10. **File No. 25033:** Joudere Gaines against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (02:44:40)

(On 9/23/2025, the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee continued and forwarded the matter to the Complaint Committee and asked that the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency provide a point-by-point response to each of the requested listed in NR-24-6646 located on pages 3-8 of the meeting packet.)

(On 11/18/2025, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the full Task Force with no recommendation.)

Joudere Gaines (Petitioner) was not present.

Scott Edwards (Respondent) was present.

Action: Moved by Chair Yankee, seconded by Member Schmidt, to close File No. 25033 per Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Complaint Procedure, Section C(7)(b).

Public Comment: Aaron Wilson stated that Petitioner should have respect for the Task Force and missed out on an opportunity to participate in San Francisco government.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Yankee, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Hyland, Pilpel, Wolfe, Stein

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 - Kumar

11. **File No. 25075:** Complaint filed by Jared Stratton against the San Francisco Police Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (02:49:50)

(On 11/18/2025, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the full Task Force with no recommendation.)

Member Hyland was noted absent at 7:02 pm.

Jarrod Stratton (Petitioner) presented his position and stated that the public interest outweighs whatever is in the file.

Lt. William Heppler (Respondent) provided an overview of the case and stated that on 9/12/2025 Petitioner was informed that his request was denied due to the open case investigation exemption per Gov. Code Section 7923.660, and that this case remains an open investigation and disclosure of the requested information would endanger the successful completion of the investigation and/or adjudication. Lt. Heppler further stated that a second similar request received 9/28/2025 was also denied. Lt. Heppler stated that he spoke with Homicide detail and confirmed that the case is active and that no parts could be released at this time and were withheld correctly per Section 7923.660, and that he consulted with their Deputy City Attorney to confirm that that Section 67.24(d) has been complied with.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

The parties provided rebuttals.

Action: Moved by Chair Yankee, seconded by Wolfe, to continue the matter to the January 7, 2026 Regular Meeting of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force meeting. The Task Force further ordered the San Francisco Police Department to review the April 17, 2025 flowchart developed by Lt. Ozol re File No. 23086 for reviewing an “open/active investigation” and provide a written response to the Task Force with the results of applying the flowchart and California Senate Bill 16 (2021) to the review of this file.

Public Comment: Aaron Wilson stated that it's good that the Task Force is trying to get to the bottom of these types of cases and that public officials who attempt to conduct the public's business in secret should be held accountable.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 8 – Yankee, Wolfe, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Pilpel, Stein

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 2 – Kumar, Hyland

The Task Force was in recess from 7:58 until 8:09 pm.

12. **Hearing on Sunshine Ordinance Amendments:** Discussion and potential action regarding proposed amendments to the Sunshine Ordinance. (04:21:12)

The members discussed and edited the proposed amendments and the preparation of a summary with annotations.

Member Sugarman was noted absent at 9:44 p.m.

Public Comment: None

No action taken.

13. **Hearing on the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force's 2025 Annual Report:** Discuss and authorize production of the SOTF's 2025 Annual Report. (05:47:13)

Members of the public can view these documents online at the link below (no password or identification required) or review the printed versions in the agenda packet. Public comments on these documents can be sent directly to lstein.sotf@gmail.com or made during public comment on this agenda item.

[Annual Report 2025 Documents Folder \(Main Folder\)](#)

The members discussed other possible data points to collect, including the results of matters that proceed to compliance, [see audio]

Action: Moved by Anderson, seconded by Member Pilpel, to authorize the production of the annual report pursuant to the proposal.

Public Comment: None

The motion PASSED on the following vote:

Ayes: 7 – Anderson, Pilpel, Schmidt, LaHood, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 3 – Sugarman, Kumar, Hyland

14. **Hearing on SB 707 modifying the Ralph M. Brown Act:** Review changes to various public meetings effectuated by the passage of SB 707 and potentially take action to communicate implications to City departments and officials. (06:07:15)

The members discussed drafting a letter to departments and commission secretaries about practical implications of SB 707 by the end of year.

Action: Motion by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Anderson, to authorize a brief memo to City departments regarding SB 707.

Public Comment: None

The motion PASSED on the following vote:

Ayes: 7 – Pilpel, Anderson, Schmidt, LaHood, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 3 – Sugarman, Kumar, Hyland

15. Announcements, Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items by Members of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force. (06:20:15)

(Note: Public Comment on this item is limited to subject matters presented by members of the Task Force.)

No action taken.

16. ADJOURNMENT (03:20:40)

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 10:30 p.m.

APPROVED: 1/7/2026
Sunshine Ordinance Task Force

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.

#