

City and County of San Francisco

Sunshine Ordinance Task Force

City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Special Meeting Minutes

Members:

Seat 1	Dean Schmidt	Seat 7	Matthew Yankee - Chair
Seat 2	Lila LaHood	Seat 8	Chris Hyland
Seat 3	Saul Sugarman	Seat 9	David Pilpel
Seat 4	Ankita Kumar	Seat 10	VACANT
Seat 5	Maxine Anderson	Seat 11	Bruce Wolfe
Seat 6	Laura Stein - Vice-Chair		

Ex-officio (non-voting) Clerk of the Board of Supervisors or their designee

Ex-officio (non-voting) Michael Adams, Mayor's designee

> Clerk: Patricia Petersen (415) 554-7719 ~ patricia.petersen@sfgov.org

Wednesday, October 15,	4:30 p.m.	City Hall Doom 416
2025	Special Meeting	City Hall, Room 416

1. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND AGENDA CHANGES (00:01:18)

Chair Yankee called the meeting to order at 5:54 p.m. On the call of the roll Chair Yankee, Vice-Chair Stein and Members LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, and Wolfe were noted present. Members Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, and Pilpel were noted absent. Ex-officio Member Michael Adams provided advance written notice of his unavailability and was noted absent. A quorum was present. Deputy City Attorney Jose Zelidon was present. Administrator Pat Petersen was present.

Petitioner Gilbert Kenneth Solt informed the Task Force on 10/10/2025 that he was unable to attend this evening's meeting.

Action: Moved by Member Anderson, seconded by Member LaHood, to continue Item 18 (File No. 25073 in re Gilbert Kenneth Solt against the Human Services Agency) to the next available Committee meeting.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 - Anderson, LaHood, Sugarman, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 4 – Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel

2. Approval of the August 6, 2025 Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Regular Meeting minutes. (02:39:28)

Action: Moved by Vice-Chair Stein, seconded by Member Wolfe, to approve the August 6, 2025 minutes.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 – Stein, Wolfe, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 4 – Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel

3. Approval of the September 3, 2025, Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Regular Meeting minutes. (02:41:47)

Action: Moved by Member Wolfe, seconded by Member Anderson, to approve the September 3, 2025 minutes.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 – Wolfe, Anderson, LaHood, Sugarman, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 4 - Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel

- 4. **Approval of Orders of Determination** (02:43:24)
 - File No. 25032 Michael J. Turon against Assessor-Recorder Joaquin Torres, Aydin Salim Kayali, and the Office of the Assessor-Recorder
 - File No. 25038 Paul Kniha against San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency
 - File No. 25043 Anmarie against Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco
 - File No. 25048 Mark Sullivan against David Steinberg and San Francisco Public Works

• File No. 25059 Patrick Monette-Shaw against Department of Public Health

• File No. 25060 Ben Lynch against City Attorney's Office

• File No. 25061 Marc Bruno against the San Francisco Planning Department

• File No. 25065 Richard Corriea against Supervisor Joel Engardio

Action: Moved by Chair Yankee, seconded by Vice-Chair Stein, to approve the Orders of Determination / Advisory Opinion as amended.

Paul Kniha asked as to the status of his matters on this evening's Consent Agenda.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 - Yankee, Stein, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Wolfe

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 4 – Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel

5. **Administrator's Report.** (02:51:04)

The members discussed coverage and possible rescheduling of upcoming Committee meetings.

Public Comment: None

No action taken.

6. **Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction but not on today's agenda. (00:05:55)

Stefano Zygomalas / American Legion War Memorial Commissioner stated that he was unclear about the Administrator's request for supporting documents (File 25056) asked whether he could submit a new complaint demonstrating that Kate Sofis / War Memorial and Performing Arts Center Managing Director is paid with City funds.

- 7. **Hearing Closing Pending Complaint Files**: Hearing to consider closing the following complaint files pursuant to SOTF Complaint Procedure C(9).
 - 7a. File No. 21033: Zach Karnazes against Mayor's Office on Disability
 - 7b. File No. 21034: Zach Karnazes against Human Services Agency
 - 7c. File No. 21035: Zach Karnazes against Department of Technology

File Nos. 21033, 21034 and 21035 were closed at the request of the Petitioner.

CONSENT AGENDA – Items 8 through 15 (00:11:42)

8. **File No. 24007:** Complaint filed by Kevin Cantwell against the Police Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to provide records in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:13:08)

(On 9/23/2025, the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find no violation.)

Member Wolfe requested that Item #8 (File No. 24007) be severed from the Consent Agenda.

Action: Moved by Member Wolfe, seconded by Vice-Chair Stein, to adopt the September 23, 2025 recommendation of the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee regarding File No. 24007 that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the records are public, and to send the matter to the Consent Agenda with a finding of no violation.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 – Wolfe, Stein, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 4 – Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel

9. **File No. 24022:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating the Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25, by failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:14:00)

- 10. **File No. 24030:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25, by failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:14:20)
- 11. **File No. 24036:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a request for records in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:14:40)

(On 1/28/2025, the Education, Outreach and Training Committee, hearing File Nos. 24022, 24030 and 24036 together, found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the records are public, and referred the matters to the full Task Force consent calendar.

The Committee further found that these public records per Section 67.21(L) are available and easily generated by the MTA and did not recommend a finding of a violation. However, the Committee requested that the MTA produce the transcripts from the March 29, April 26, and May 31, 2024 color curb hearings and send the transcripts to Mr. Kniha within 14 calendar days. The Committee further requested that the MTA produce future color curb hearing transcripts upon request. The Committee requested that the MTA propose a policy on transparency and transcripts for public-facing events, hearings, and meetings.

On 6/4/2025, the Task Force approved the Consent Agenda and accepted the recommendations of the Committee for File Nos. 24022, 24030, and 24036.

On 6/24/2025, the Compliance and Amendments Committee continued the matter to the call of the Chair.

On 7/2/2025, the Task Force approved the Orders of Determination for File Nos. 24022, 24030, and 24036.

Because the Task Force found no violations, and because the Compliance and Amendments Committee also held a follow-up hearing on the matter, the Chair recommends that File Nos. 24022, 24030, and 24036 be closed.)

12. **File No. 25037:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency and Erion Hom-Duong for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:17:09)

13. **File No. 25042:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:17:29)

(On 9/23/2025, the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee combined File 25042 with File 25037, found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, and referred the matter to the Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find no violation by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency because the matter is a duplicate of the matters adjudicated previously in File Nos. 24022, 24030, and 24036. Additionally, the Administrator was directed to reject as duplicative any complaints by Mr. Kniha against the SFMTA regarding text transcripts of color curb hearings.)

14. **File No. 25053:** Complaint filed by Michael Petrelis against the Human Rights Commission, for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.29-5, by failing to respond to a request for Proposition G Calendar in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:18:17)

(On 9/3/2025, the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find that the Human Rights Commission violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance) Section(s) 67.29-5 by failing to provide a Prop G calendar in a timely and/or complete manner. The Administrator was instructed to confirm that the requested records were forwarded to Mr. Petrelis before agendizing the matter before the Task Force, or the matter would be referred to a Committee for compliance.)

15. **File No. 25071:** Complaint filed by Wesley Saunders against the San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21(b) by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:19:38)

(On 9/3/2025, the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find no violation.)

Action: Moved by Member Wolfe, seconded by Member Anderson, to approve the Consent Agenda and adopt the recommendations of the Committees.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 - Wolfe, Anderson, LaHood, Sugarman, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 4 – Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel

COMPLAINT HEARING AGENDA – Item 16 - 18

16. **File No. 25028:** Complaint filed by Anmarie against the Fine Arts Museums of San Francsico for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.5 by failing to hold open meetings, 67.7 by failing to post an agenda, 67.15 by failing to allow public testimony, and 67.16 by failing to record and post minutes of regular and special meetings of the board or commission. (00:27:10)

(On 5/20/2025, the Complaint Committee referred the matter to the full Task Force for consideration of whether there is a violation of Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.21 for failing to produce public records.

On 7/2/2025, the Task Force continued the matter to the call of the Chair.

On 8/6/2025, the Task Force found that the Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco (FAMSF) violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance) Section 67.21. by failing and refusing to seek and produce the requested documents and ordered that they do so. In addition, the Task Force found that the attendance by a majority the FAMSF trustees at meetings of the Corporation of the Fine Arts Museums of San Francsico implicates Section 67.3(b) and thus those are public meetings and the meetings proferred by Petitioner were done in violation of Section 67.5 by failing to hold open and public meetings, Section 67.7 by failing to post an agenda with a meaningful description of each item to be transacted or discussed at the meeting, Section 67.15 by failing to provide an opportunity for members of the public to directly address a policy body on items of interest to the public that are within the policy body's subject matter jurisdiction, and Section 67.16 by failing to record the minutes for each regular and special meeting of the board or commission. The matter was referred to a Committee for compliance and follow up.)

Anmarie (Petitioner) stated that following the Task Force decision of September 3, she received a response from Respondent on September 9 invoking a 14-day extension to consult with a city attorney. Anmarie further stated that on September 23 she received a communication that FAMSF had no responsive records.

The Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco (FAMSF) (Respondent) was not present.

Administrator Petersen stated that she was unable to confirm Petitioner's receipt of the Notice of Hearing, and further stated that the FAMSF Commission Secretary is on leave and the substitute representative had not need noticed regarding tonight's Agenda.

Action: Moved by Chair Yankee, seconded by Member Anderson, to continue File No. 25028 for compliance to the call of the Chair.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 - Yankee, Anderson, LaHood, Sugarman, Wolfe, Stein

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 4 – Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel

17. **File No. 25063:** Complaint filed by Hanley Chan against the Department of Information Technology for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25 by failing to respond by failing to respond to an immediate disclosure request in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:40:24)

Hanley Chan (Petitioner) stated that he requested email communications from or to Kate Sofis related to American Legion members, veterans' programs, policy matters, and use of War Memorial facilities from January 1, 2024 to present but has not received a response. Mr. Chan further stated that the Department of Technology holds all the information in everybody's email accounts.

Karen Hong / Chief of Staff (Respondent) stated that upon review of the Agenda packet and the July 5 communication to dtis.helpdesk@sfgov.org (p. 76), she checked with the departmental email administrator and confirmed that the request had not been received. Ms. Hong further stated that even if the request had been received, the response would have been that the Department of Technology would have searched only its internal email and that the War Memorial is the custodian of records for its emails.

Action: Moved by Vice-Chair Stein, seconded by Member Wolfe, to find that the Task Force has jurisdiction in File No. 25063.

Public Comment: Stefano Zygomalas / American Legion War Memorial Commissioner stated that the Task Force has jurisdiction because Kate Sofis / War Memorial and Performing Arts Center Managing Director is paid by the City of San Francisco.

The parties provided rebuttals.

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 – Stein, Wolfe, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 4 – Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel

The parties provided rebuttals.

Action: Moved by Vice-Chair Stein, seconded by Member Anderson, to find that the Department of Information Technology violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.25, by failing to respond to an immediate disclosure request in a timely and/or complete manner. The Respondent is to provide a written response by 11/19/2025 explaining why the department feels it is neither the custodian nor in custody of the requested records as described by the Sunshine Ordinance.

In addition, the Task Force stated that a violation was found because a records request was made and further requested that Respondent provide by 11/19/2025 a written response to the request and provide a detailed written response if it is determined that Respondent will not provide the records.

Deputy City Attorney Zelidon will opine on the definition of custodian and custody and deliver a written response in 3-4 weeks.

Public Comment on Language Added After the Motion: Stefano Zygomalas / American Legion War Memorial Commissioner stated he received over 2,000 emails from San Francisco State University after graduating, as did several thousand other people. Mr. Zygomalas further stated that NASA/Ames has a lot of information to keep track of, that information is what we do here in the Bay Area, and that a million emails is nothing.

Honest Charlie Bodkin stated that according to the Oxford Dictionary, custody is defined as the protective care or guardianship of someone or something. Mr. Bodkin further stated that the Department of Technology is indeed in charge of protecting ad serving as the guardian of these records, and the Compliance and Amendments Committee should amend the Ordinance to define what custody means in lieu of leaning on a dictionary definition as any reasonable person would.

The Task Force was in recess from 7:55 until 8:05 p.m.

Honest Charlie Bodkin offered public comment on Part 2 of the motion.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 – Stein, Anderson, LaHood, Sugarman, Wolfe, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 4 – Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel

18. **File No. 25073:** Complaint filed by Gilbert Kenneth Solt against the Human Services Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner.

See action taken under Item 1.

19. **Hearing on Sunshine Ordinance Amendments:** Discussion regarding amendments to the Sunshine Ordinance and potential action to guide the related work of the Compliance and Amendments Committee. (03:05:55)

The members discussed a public communication received from Joe Dworetzky / Bay City News, the public's access to public records requests submitted through NextRequest, and opportunities for departments to make regularly-requested records available in centralized repositories.

Public Comment: None

No action taken.

20. Announcements, Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items by Members of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force (03:29:50)

The members discussed the upcoming meeting of the Commission Streamlining Task Force on November 5, 2025 at which the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force would be discussed.

Public Comment: None

No action taken.

21. **ADJOURNMENT** (03:33:54)

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 9:28 p.m.

Approved: 11/5/2025

Sunshine Ordinance Task Force

N.B. the Minutes of this meeting set forth all action taken by the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.

###