



**City and County of  
San Francisco**  
**Sunshine Ordinance Task Force**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place,  
Room 244  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

**Meeting Agenda**

***Members:***

Seat 1	Dean Schmidt	Seat 7	Matthew Yankee - <b>Chair</b>
Seat 2	Lila LaHood	Seat 8	Chris Hyland
Seat 3	Saul Sugarman	Seat 9	David Pilpel
Seat 4	Ankita Kumar	Seat 10	VACANT
Seat 5	Maxine Anderson	Seat 11	Bruce Wolfe
Seat 6	Laura Stein - <b>Vice-Chair</b>		
Ex-officio	<i>(non-voting)</i> Clerk of the Board of Supervisors or their designee		
Ex-officio	<i>(non-voting)</i> Jack Livingston, Mayor's designee		

*Clerk: Patricia H. Petersen*  
(415) 554-7719 ~ [soff@sfgov.org](mailto:soff@sfgov.org)

---

**Wednesday, June 4, 2025**

**4:00 p.m.**  
**Regular Meeting**

**City Hall, Room 408**

**NOTE: Hearings on Complaints will begin no earlier than 5:00 p.m. (see details below)**

---

**1. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND AGENDA CHANGES (00:01:04)**

Chair Yankee called the meeting to order at 4:12 p.m. On the call of the roll, Chair Yankee, Vice-Chair Stein, and Members Schmidt, Kumar, Anderson, Hyland, Pilpel, and Wolfe were noted present. Members LaHood and Sugarman were noted absent. There was a quorum. Ex-officio Member Livingston and Task Force Administrator Pat Petersen were present. Deputy City Attorney Adam Shapiro was present.

Administrator Petersen stated that a written resignation had been received from Amerika Sanchez after the Agenda had been posted but before the start of the meeting.

A Request for Continuance of File No. 25032 (Michael Turon against Office of the Assessor-Recorder [Item 15]) was received in advance of the start of the meeting, and the following action was taken:

**Action: Moved by Member Anderson, seconded by Vice-Chair Stein, to continue the matter to the call of the Chair.**

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 8 – Anderson, Stein, Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel, Wolfe, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 2 - LaHood, Sugarman

2. **Approval of the minutes from the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Regular Meeting of May 7, 2025 (00:09:37)**

The Members discussed edits to the meeting minutes.

**Action: Motion by Member Wolfe, seconded by Member Kumar, to approve the Minutes as amended.**

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 8 – Wolfe, Kumar, Schmidt, Anderson, Hyland, Pilpel, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

3. **Approval of Orders of Determination (00:16:46)**

- **File No. 25025:** Veronica Stamper against the San Francisco Police Department

The Members discussed edits to the Order of Determination.

**Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Anderson, to approve the Order of Determination as amended.**

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 8 – Pilpel, Anderson, Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

4. **Chair's Report** (00:20:21)

- Update on discussions with the Ethics Commission staff regarding improvements to the San Francisco Ethics Commission Enforcement Regulations
- Potential action to authorize a Task Force representative for the Ethics Commission Show Cause Hearing regarding File No. 24021 (Matthew Lotocki against the San Francisco Police Department)
- Update on discussions with the Custodians of Records Working Group
- Time Limits on Agenda Items and Active Complaints

The Members discussed the continued interest in understanding and utilizing enforcement referrals to deter and remedy unlawful conduct, discussions with the Custodians of Records Working Group meeting of 5/29/2025, and the use of time limits to improve efficiency during meetings.

**Motion by Member Wolfe, seconded by Member Pilpel, to authorize Member Dean Schmidt to be the authorized representative at the Ethics Commission Show Cause Hearing regarding File No. 24021, Matthew Lotocki against the San Francisco Police Department.**

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 8 – Wolfe, Pilpel, Schmidt, Kumar, Anderson, Hyland, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

5. **Administrator's Report** (05:04:12)

- Task Force and Committee tentative hearing schedule with potential adjustments
- Complaints and Hearing Requests
- Pending Petitions/Complaints
- SOTF Member Attendance
- Communications

SOTF Administrator Petersen presented the report which was discussed by the Members.

Public Comment: None.

No action taken.

6. **PUBLIC COMMENT:** Members of the public may address the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force (SOTF) on matters that are within SOTF's jurisdiction but not on today's agenda. (01:00:57)

Paul Kniha commented on the effect on journalists and taxpayers of the removal by the Trump White House of a database of official transcripts President Trump's announcements and appearances. Mr. Kniha further stated that the Trump White House is the most transparent in history, and that the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency stopped keeping transcripts after they were used as evidence to censor public comment and show that staff made misleading statements.

Barklee Sanders stated that there is open-source software and AI that can transcribe a 3-hour meeting in 15 minutes and that transcripts do not need to be sent to an external service.

**CONSENT AGENDA – Items 7 through 10** (01:06:37)

The Sunshine Ordinance Task Force shall review **File Nos. 24022, 24030, 24036 and 25029** to affirm the Committee's findings regarding the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force's jurisdiction; violations of the Sunshine Ordinance, Brown Act, or California Public Records Act; and, if applicable, to issue an Order of Determination and refer matters to a Committee for monitoring. The Complainant and Respondent are *not required to attend the June 6, 2025 Sunshine Ordinance Task Force meeting but may attend to provide testimony during the public comment period for this item related to the determinations listed below. (Discussion and Action)*

7. **File No. 24022:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating the Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25, by failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request in a timely and/or complete manner.
8. **File No. 24030:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating the Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25, by failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request in a timely and/or complete manner.
9. **File No. 24036:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating the Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25, by failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request in a timely and/or complete manner.  
*(On 1/28/2025, the Education, Outreach and Training Committee, hearing File Nos. 24022, 24030 and 24036 together, found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the records are public, and referred the matters to the full Task Force consent calendar.*

*The Committee further found that these public records per Section 67.21(L) are available and easily generated by the MTA and did not recommend a finding of a violation. However, the Committee requested that the MTA produce the transcripts from the March 29, April 26, and May 31, 2024 color curb hearings and send the transcripts to Mr. Kniha within 14 calendar days. The Committee further requested that the MTA produce future color curb hearing transcripts upon request. The Committee requested that the MTA propose a policy on transparency and transcripts for public-facing events, hearings, and meetings.)*

**Action:** Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Kumar, to approve the Consent Agenda and accept the recommendations of the Committee for File Nos. 24022, 24030 and 24036.

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 8 – Pilpel, Kumar, Schmidt, Anderson, Hyland, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

10. **File No. 25029:** Complaint filed by Madison Alvarado against the San Francisco Police Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner.

*(On 5/20/2025, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and found a violation of Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance) Section 67.21, and forwarded the matter to the Task Force Consent Agenda and ordered under Section 67.21 that the records be produced as requested, and further referred the matter to the Compliance and Amendments Committee for monitoring at the next available meeting.)*

Member Schmidt requested that File 25029 be severed from the Consent Agenda.

**Action:** Moved by Vice-Chair Stein, seconded by Member Anderson, to accept the recommendation of the Committee and find a violation of Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.21(b) for failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner, and an additional violation of Section 67.21(c) for failing to assist a requestor.

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 8 – Stein, Anderson, Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland, Pilpel, Wolfe, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

The meeting was in recess from 5:38 p.m. to 5:48 p.m. When the meeting reconvened, Member Hyland was noted absent but returned at 5:53 p.m.

**COMPLAINT HEARING AGENDA – Items 11 through 16**

11. **File No. 23092:** Complaint filed by Zach Karnazes against the Mayor’s Office on Disability for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.12, 67.15, and 67.25, by failing to provide an opportunity for members of the public to directly address a body on items of interest on the agenda. (01:36:44)

*(On 5/20/2025, the Complaint Committee referred the matter to the full Task Force for consideration of jurisdiction and possible violation of Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance) Section 67.15 and the Brown Act, and to consider and make a decision as to the claims made.)*

- a) Hearing on the complaint. *(Discussion and Action)*

Zach Karnazes (Petitioner) stated that this is a recurring event and referenced that a violation against Deborah Kaplan was in File 20067. Mr. Karnazes further stated that there have been multiple cases regarding public access and making public comment at meetings, that members are not checking the chat, and that he had to use his public comment time to ask for help. Mr. Karnazes stated that that his records have been withheld, and the public is not being served.

Deborah Kaplan (Respondent) stated that MOD (now Office of Disability and Accessibility) is a small office that supports the Mayor’s Disability Council. Ms. Kaplan further stated that at the 10/20 meeting, Petitioner did make general public comment. Ms. Kaplan stated that the clerk is involved in multiple tasks including monitoring the interpreters and microphones and watching for requests to make public comment and that here, neither the clerk nor SFGov staff saw any hands raised. She also noted that the Mayor’s Disability Council is a passive meeting body.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

The parties were given the opportunity for rebuttals.

**Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Vice-Chair Stein, to find no violation of the Sunshine Ordinance.**

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 – Pilpel, Stein, Schmidt, Anderson, Hyland, Yankee

Noes: 2 – Kumar, Wolfe

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

12. **File No. 25003:** Complaint filed by Justin Barker against San Francisco Zoo for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (02:28:31)

*(On 3/5/2025, the Task Force approved the Order of Determination re File No. 25003 and instructed that the Joint Zoo Committee work with the Education, Outreach and Training Committee to comply with the Sunshine Ordinance going forward.)*

*The 3/18/2025 Special Meeting of the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee did not meet due to the incorrect instructions for attending the meeting remotely.*

*On 4/2/2025, the Task Force found that the Zoological Society had not complied with the 2/5/2025 Order of Determination to produce records, and that the Zoological Society is subject to the Sunshine Ordinance under the SF Zoo Lease and Management Agreement of 1993. The Task Force asked that Recreation and Parks Department General Manager Phil Ginsburg facilitate the production of those records and referred the matter to the Compliance and Amendments Committee for monitoring.*

*On 4/22/2025, the Compliance and Amendments Committee acknowledged receipt of a 4/21/2025 letter from Recreation and Parks General Manager Ginsburg to SF Zoological Society Executive Director Tanya Peterson asking that this and all future public records requests related the San Francisco Zoo be facilitated by the Recreation and Parks Custodian of Records. General Manager Ginsburg further requested that the records pertaining to File No. 25003 be provided to Petitioner no later than May 1, 2025.*

*On 5/7/2025, the Task Force continued the matter to the call of the Chair.)*

- a) Hearing on the status of the complaint and consideration of enforcement action.  
(Discussion and Action)

Justin Barker (Petitioner) stated that he has received none of the records that he requested. Mr. Barker further stated that the Zoo is now blocking an audit and has submitted data to the Budget and Legislative Analyst that does not match its tax records. Mr. Barker stated that the Zoo is a publicly funded entity that is violating public trust leaving matters to watchdogs and asks that the Task Force send a message that this is not permissible.

Ingrid Russell, Director of Collections for the SF Zoo (Respondent), stated that she believed records were submitted but does not have the details. Ms. Russell further stated that for the past 15 years she has prepared the reports of data regarding birth, death, and explanations of animal welfare. Ms. Russell stated that during open meetings, there is the opportunity for the public to ask questions, and that medical and personnel records are confidential.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

**Action: Moved by Member Wolfe, seconded by Member Pilpel, to refer the matter to the Compliance and Amendments Committee for monitoring and send a letter to the Board of Supervisors expressing the frustrations of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force with the San Francisco Zoo's lack of compliance.**

Public Comment: Michael Angelo Torres stated that he supports the submission of a letter.

The action **FAILED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 5 – Wolfe, Pilpel, Schmidt, Kumar, Hyland

Noes: 3 – Anderson, Stein, Yankee

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

**Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Wolfe, to close the file and send a letter to the Board of Supervisors expressing the frustrations of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force with the San Francisco Zoo's lack of compliance.**

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 – Pilpel, Wolfe, Kumar, Anderson, Hyland, Yankee

Noes: 2 – Schmidt, Stein

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

13. **File No. 24064:** Complaint filed by Matt Joseph against the Department of Building Inspection for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21(k) by failing to release documentary public information, 67.26 by failing to disclose records in their entirety, and 67.27 by failing to provide justification for the withholding of information in writing. (03:21:11)

*(On 3/25/2025, the Complaint Committee found that these are public documents under the jurisdiction of the Task Force and referred the matter to the full Task Force for consideration.*

*(On 5/7/2025, the Task Force continued the matter to the 6/4/2025 Regular Meeting of the Task Force.)*

- a) Hearing on the complaint. *(Discussion and Action)*

Matt Joseph (Petitioner) stated that the Department of Building Inspection (DBI) puts restrictions on records and the meta data has been stripped from the documents. Mr. Joseph further stated that DBI also interprets the application of the Sunshine Ordinance and should produce the records *as held* even though the Task Force has opined that records are to be produced *including metadata*. Mr. Joseph proposed policy changes for distributing operational materials with an intent to solve these problems at a policy level.

Alex Lewis-Koskinen, Deputy Director Finance Services/Administration (Respondent), stated that records requested have been provided in the format requested. Mr. Lewis-Koskinen stated that he understands that Petitioner is advocating for all future requestors, that the Department is committed to providing the same unaltered records to anyone who requests them, and that Petitioner's broader requests will take time to get there.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

The parties were given the opportunity for rebuttals.

**Action: Moved by Member Kumar, seconded by Member Schmidt, to find no violation of the Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Sections 67.21(k), 67.26, and 67.27.**

Public Comment: None



The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 8 – Kumar, Schmidt, Anderson, Hyland, Pilpel, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

The meeting was in recess from 8:17 p.m. until 8:26 p.m. Member Hyland was noted absent when the meeting resumed but returned at 8:29 p.m.

14. **File No. 25030:** Complaint filed Barklee Sanders against the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner, 67.25 by failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request in a timely and/or manner, and 67.27 by failing to provide written justification for withholdings. (04:15:01)

*(On 5/20/2025, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, the requested records are public and referred the matter to the full Task Force for consideration of a violation of Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance) Section 67.21 for failure to produce records in a timely and/or complete manner.)*

a) Hearing on the complaint. *(Discussion and Action)*

Barklee Sanders (Petitioner) was not present.

Representatives from the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission were present.

**Action: Moved by Vice-Chair Stein, seconded by Member Schmidt, to close the case per Complaint Procedure, Section 7(b).**

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 8 – Stein, Schmidt, Kumar, Anderson, Hyland, Pilpel, Wolfe, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 2 – LaHood, Sugarman

15. **File No. 25032:** Complaint filed by Michael J. Turon against Assessor-Recorder Joaquin Torres, Aydin Salim Kayali, and the Office of the Assessor-Recorder for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25 by failing to respond to an Immediately Disclosure Request in a timely and/or complete manner, 67.26 by failing to keep the withholding of records to a minimum and 67.27 by failing to provide justification for withholding information. Additional allegations: Violations of California Government Code, Sections 7922.525 and 7922.535(a).

*(On 5/20/2025, the Complaint Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested documents are public, and referred the matter to the full Task Force to consider whether there is a violation of administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.21.*

- a) Hearing on the complaint. *(Discussion and Action)*

**See Action taken under Item 1.**

16. **File No. 24060:** Complaint filed by Lou Barberini against Jesus Yanez, Police Commissioner, for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.7(d), by discussing a matter not appearing on the posted agenda. (04:29:44)

*(On 1/28/2025, the Education, Outreach and Training Committee found that the Task Force has jurisdiction and forwarded the matter to the full Task Force for Hearing. The Committee requests that the Task Force focus on Section 67.7(d) and watch the 5:00 video [to be linked in the Agenda] as background and asks that the Commission Secretary provide the agenda and minutes, noting the discussion was not part of the agenda.)*

- a) Hearing on the complaint. *(Discussion and Action)*

Lou Barberini (Petitioner) stated that the November 5 video of the Police Commission meeting shows that Jesus Yanez spoke on a matter that was not on the agenda in violation of the Brown Act.

Jesus Yanez (Former Police Commissioner) was not present.

Sgt. Stacy Youngblood was present to represent the Police Commission as its Secretary. Chair Yankee stated that as such he would be allowed to provide public comment.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

Petitioner Barberini provided a rebuttal.

Member Hyland was noted absent at 9:04 pm.

**Action: Moved by Vice-Chair Stein, seconded by Member Anderson, to find no violation.**

Public Comment: None

The action **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 – Stein, Anderson, Schmidt, Pilpel, Wolfe, Yankee

Noes: 1 - Kumar

Absent: 3 – LaHood, Sugarman, Hyland

17. **Hearing on Sunshine Ordinance Amendments:** Discussion regarding amendments to the Sunshine Ordinance and potential action to guide the related work of the Compliance and Amendments Committee. (05:20:56)

Member Kumar noted absent at 9:35 pm.

The Task Force members discussed the purpose of Immediate Disclosure Requests, various avenues for enforcement of Task Force orders, the appropriate location in the Code to include the Records Management Retention Policy, the value of the Supervisor of Records position, consideration of requirements to post some records online automatically, and whether there should be a standardized index of public meetings occurring in the City.

Public Comment: None

No action taken.

18. **Announcements, Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items by Members of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.** (05:49:13)

*(Note: Public Comment on this item is limited to subject matters presented by members of the SOTF.)*

Public Comment: None

No action taken.

19. **ADJOURNMENT** (05:50:22)

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 10:02 p.m.

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_  
Sunshine Ordinance Task Force

N.B. the Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.

# # #