



**City and County of
San Francisco**
Sunshine Ordinance Task Force
Meeting Minutes

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place,
Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members:

Seat 1	Dean Schmidt	Seat 7	Matthew Yankee - Chair
Seat 2	Lila LaHood	Seat 8	Chris Hyland
Seat 3	Saul Sugarman	Seat 9	David Pilpel
Seat 4	Ankita Kumar	Seat 10	Amerika Sanchez
Seat 5	Maxine Anderson	Seat 11	Bruce Wolfe
Seat 6	Laura Stein - Vice-Chair		
Ex-officio	<i>(non-voting)</i> Clerk of the Board of Supervisors or their designee		
Ex-officio	<i>(non-voting)</i> Jack Livingston, Mayor's designee		

Clerk: Patricia H. Petersen
(415) 554-7719 ~ sotf@sfgov.org

Wednesday, May 7, 2025

**4:00 p.m.
Regular Meeting**

City Hall, Room 408

1. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND AGENDA CHANGES (00:00:45)

Chair Yankee called the meeting to order at 4:09 p.m. On the call of the roll, Chair Yankee, Vice-Chair Stein and Members Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Hyland, and Wolfe were noted present. Members Kumar, Pilpel and Sanchez were noted absent. There was a quorum. Ex-officio Member Livingston and Task Force Administrator Pat Petersen were present. There was no Deputy City Attorney present.

Member Pilpel was noted present at 4:13 p.m.
Member Kumar was noted present at 4:29 p.m.

Public Comment: None.

Action: Moved by Member Hyland, seconded by Member Wolfe, to continue Item 11 to the June 4, 2025 Task Force meeting.

Public comment: None.

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 10 – Hyland, Wolfe, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Kumar, Anderson, Pilpel, Stein
Yankee
Noes: 0 - None
Absent: 1 – Sanchez

2. **Welcome new Task Force Members and Introductory Remarks.** (00:06:35)

Member Jack Livingston, Mayor's Designee, provided comments.

Public Comment: Veronica Stamper stated that she is present.

No Actions Taken.

3. **Approval of the minutes from the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Regular Meeting of April 2, 2025.** (00:14:04)

Action: Moved by Vice-Chair Stein, seconded by Member Hyland, to approve the April 2, 2025 Minutes, as amended.

Public Comment: Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, libraryusers2004@yahoo.com, P.O. Box 170544, San Francisco, CA 94117-0544, stated his disappointment that there was limited public comment and noted that the header on the Minutes should say "Minutes" instead of Agenda."

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Stein, Hyland, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Kumar, Anderson, Wolfe, Yankee

Noes: 1 - Pilpel

Absent: 1 – Sanchez

4. **Approval of Orders of Determination** (00:22:37)

- **File No. 25018** Jonathan Balog against Office of Short-Term Rentals, SF Planning

Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Wolfe, to approve the Order of Determination for File No. 25018.

Public Comment: None

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 10 – Pilpel, Wolfe, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Kumar, Anderson, Hyland, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 1 – Sanchez

5. **Election of Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Officers pursuant to Article III, Section 5 of the By-Laws.** (00:25:05)

a) Nominations and election of Chair.

b) Nominations and election of Vice-Chair.

The Members discussed nominations and elections of the Chair and Vice-Chair for the current year.

Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Kumar, to elect Matt Yankee as Chair of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.

Public Comment: None.

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 10 – Pilpel, Kumar, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Hyland, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 1 – Sanchez

Action: Motion by Member Sugarman, seconded by Member Kumar, to elect Laura Stein as Vice-Chair of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.

Public Comment: None

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 10 – Sugarman, Kumar, Schmidt, LaHood, Anderson, Hyland, Pilpel, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 1 – Sanchez

6. Administrator's Report (00:31:40)

- Task Force and Committee tentative hearing schedule with potential adjustments
- Complaints and Hearing Requests
- Pending Petitions/Complaints
- SOTF Member Attendance
- Communications

The Task Force Administrator presented the report and answered questions throughout the discussion.

No action was taken.

Public Comment: Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, libraryusers2004@yahoo.com, P.O. Box 170544, San Francisco, CA 94117-0544, stated that he is glad to see communications in the Administrator's Report. Mr. Warfield further stated that there was a communication from Sullivan about the excellent job that the Recreation and Parks Department does with agendas and minutes, noted their clarity and full and transparency, and stated that the Task Force Minutes do not contain sufficient detail. Mr. Warfield stated that the response to Colleen Wentworth about activities concerning the Great Highway did not mention that more information could be found at the Recreation and Parks Department and that one could go into the office and look at material.

Public Comment: None.

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT:** Members of the public may address the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force (SOTF) on matters that are within SOTF's jurisdiction but not on today's agenda. (00:53:00)

Public Comment: Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, libraryusers2004@yahoo.com, P.O. Box 170544, San Francisco, CA 94117-0544, stated his concern that access to public agencies has gotten worse with COVID, and that having to speak to someone by phone if they are working from home rather than in person is a grave problem.

8. **File No. 25021:** Hearing on whether to open Sunshine Ordinance Complaint(s) by Stacy Smith against the San Francisco Public Library (Main), San Francisco Public Library (Mission Bay Branch), and the San Francisco Police Department. (00:56:57)

The Members discussed options for Mr. Smith, including whether resubmitted complaints are necessary, working with him to clarify what is sought by the complaint(s), and possible revisions to the Task Force's complaint intake form.

Public Comment: Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, libraryusers2004@yahoo.com, P.O. Box 170544, San Francisco, CA 94117-0544, stated his difficulty with the changes to Task Force rules for rejecting complaints, and that the Complaint Committee sorts through these types of questions.

Anonymous asked if there is a summary about what is being rejected when a complaint is filed.

No action was taken.

The meeting was in recess from 5:46 p.m. to 6:01 p.m. When the meeting was reconvened Member Schmidt was noted absent.

9. **File No. 22010:** Complaint filed by Ron Cicero against the Police Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (01:51:25)

(On 1/3/2024, the Task Force found that Chief William Scott (Police Department) failed to discharge the duties imposed by the Sunshine Ordinance and referred the matter to the Ethics Commission pursuant to Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.34 [willful misconduct].

On 2/4/2025, Bisi Matthews, Director of Enforcement for the Ethics Commission, informed the Task Force that the Ethics Commission dismissed the complaint's allegations pursuant to Enforcement Regulations section 4(B)(3) because the allegations, if true, did not constitute a violation of law within the Commission's jurisdiction.)

Member Schmidt was noted present at 6:04 p.m.

Lt. Jonathan Ozol, Police Department (Respondent) stated that the complainant has filed a lawsuit in this matter with the Superior Court. He noted that 389 pages, or about 10% of the records, have been produced, and cases continue to be manually scanned/redacted and

produced on a rolling basis. The Department is now releasing records that do not conflict with ongoing investigations.

Member Pilpel requested an email about the progress to date and an update on the release of records.

Lt. Ozol noted that Complainant's Superior Court case number is CPF 24-518702.

Public comment: None.

No action was taken. The file will be closed.

10. **File No. 25003:** Complaint filed by Justin Barker against San Francisco Zoo for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (02:31:41)

(On 3/5/2025, the Task Force approved the Order of Determination re File No. 25003 and instructed that the Joint Zoo Committee work with the Education, Outreach and Training Committee to comply with the Sunshine Ordinance going forward.

The 3/18/2025 Special Meeting of the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee did not meet due to the incorrect instructions for attending the meeting remotely.

On 4/2/2025, the Task Force found that the Zoological Society had not complied with the 2/5/2025 Order of Determination to produce records, and that the Zoological Society is subject to the Sunshine Ordinance under the SF Zoo Lease and Management Agreement of 1993. The Task Force asked that Recreation and Parks Department General Manager Phil Ginsburg facilitate the production of those records and referred the matter to the Compliance and Amendments Committee for monitoring.

On 4/22/2025, the Compliance and Amendments Committee acknowledged receipt of a 4/21/2024 letter from Recreation and Parks General Manager Ginsburg to SF Zoological Society Executive Director Tanya Peterson asking that this and all future public records requests related the San Francisco Zoo be facilitated by the Recreation and Parks Custodian of Records. General Manager Ginsburg further requested that the records pertaining to File No. 25003 be provided to Petitioner no later than May 1, 2025.)

Justin Barker (Petitioner) stated that he has received no records since the facilitator letter from Recreation and Parks, so he conducted a "stress test" and submitted a separate request regarding Oscar the Gorilla. Mr. Barker further stated that the Zoo says they're not releasing any records because the Zoo did not own Oscar, and he encouraged a finding that the Zoo is out of compliance with its contract as well as state and local laws. Mr. Barker stated that he wants to make this more than a contract violation and ensure that it's also a public records request matter.

Ashley Summers, Recreation and Parks Department (Respondent) stated that she worked with General Manager Ginsburg to create the facilitation letter and ensure that it had been sent. Ms. Summers further stated that minutes have been provided to Mr. Barker in response to his second records request, but that the Zoo has not given her with the other requested records, so she cannot provide them to Mr. Barker.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

Member Kumar was noted absent at 7:02 p.m.

Action: Moved by Member Hyland, seconded by Member Pilpel, to continue the matter to the call of the Chair.

Public Comment: None.

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Hyland, Pilpel, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 - None

Absent: 2 – Sanchez, Kumar

11. **File No. 24064:** Complaint filed by Matt Joseph against the Department of Building Inspection for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21(k) by failing to release documentary public information, 67.26 by failing to disclose records in their entirety, and 67.27 by failing to provide justification for the withholding of information in writing.

(On 3/25/2025, the Complaint Committee found that these are public documents under the jurisdiction of the Task Force and referred the matter to the full Task Force for consideration.)

File No. 24064 was rescheduled to the 6/4/2025 Regular Meeting of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force. (See Item 1, above.)

12. **File No. 25025:** Complaint filed by Veronica Stamper against the San Francisco Police Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (03:13:31)

Veronica Stamper (Petitioner) stated that on 4/29/2024 submitted a public records request for camera footage and related records regarding any police interactions with her brother on January 3 and 4, 2024. Ms. Stamper further stated her records request has not changed, and she has received responses citing a “heavy backlog” message with no legal reasons for the delay in providing her with records. Ms. Stamper stated that she has sent two (2) written clarifications. Ms. Stamper stated that Lt. Ozol has provided footage, but it is different from what she requested and that she has not received the 3 January footage.

Lt. Jonathan Ozol, Police Department (Respondent) stated that Petitioner’s first request on 4/29/2024 was a one-line request regarding next of kin, which staff interpreted as a request for an Incident Report. Lt. Ozol further stated that a computer glitch incorrectly sent Petitioner a form letter referring to “backlogs” for which he has apologized. Lt. Ozol stated that on 4/9/2025 Petitioner sent a clarifying request for body-worn camera footage which was provided on 4/18/2025. He stated that no additional video surveillance is available and that an additional police report could be requested from their Records Division. Lt. Ozol stated that Petitioner requested more video footage last week and the Department is working to

respond. Lt. Ozol noted that he has started review of the department's form letters to ensure they're going out correctly and clarified that the statement regarding a "heavy backlog" is not an exemption to the Sunshine Ordinance but is instead used to show that the entirety of the request may not be provided within the statutory period if it is voluminous. Lt. Ozol stated it will take a maximum of one month to produce the 1/3/2025 footage to Petitioner.

Action: Moved by Member Wolfe, seconded by Member Hyland, to find that the Task Force has jurisdiction.

Public Comment: None.

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Wolfe, Hyland, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Anderson, Pilpel, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 2 – Sanchez, Kumar

Action: Moved by Member Pilpel, seconded by Member Anderson, to find that the Police Department violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.21(b) for failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner, Section 67.21(c) for failing to assist a requestor of public records, and Gov. Code Section 7922.500 for delaying and obstructing access to public records. The Task Force ordered the San Francisco Police Department to produce the body-worn camera footage of January 3, 2024 and provide it to the Task Force Administrator by May 21, 2025.

Public Comment: None.

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 9 – Pilpel, Anderson, Schmidt, LaHood, Sugarman, Hyland, Wolfe, Stein, Yankee

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 2 – Sanchez, Kumar

A recess was taken from 8:37 to 8:44 p.m.

13. Hearing: Time Limits on Agenda Items and Active Complaints. (04:34:50)

The Members discussed the imposition of limits on the length that a case will be discussed, whether to hear items earlier than 5:00 p.m., focusing Petitioner's request on outstanding requests, having a task force member assume a timekeeper role, the importance of self-discipline and not talking among ourselves, issuing notes to the departments of observations of areas that can be improved, timing the members (2 minutes per person), having the return of DCA analyses, the redundancy of the 8 minutes provided to the parties because [Member Schmidt] has already reviewed the file instead of being able to ask question of the parties, and informal direction to the departments should be a collective decision.

Action: Moved by Member Sugarman, seconded by Member Hyland, to intend to amend for the bylaws to end general SOTF meetings at 9:00 pm unless a majority vote allows it to extend to 9:30 p.m.

Public Comment: None.

The motion FAILED on the following vote:

Ayes: 5 – Schmidt, Sugarman, Anderson, Hyland, Stein

Noes: 4 – LaHood, Pilpel, Wolfe, Yankee

Absent: 2 - Kumar, Sanchez

No action was approved.

14. **Hearing: Ethics Commission Enforcement Actions regarding Annual Ethics and Sunshine Training Requirements and Enforcement Referrals from the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.** (05:20:12)

The Members discussed options for individuals who commit willful violations, and the availability of training for staff based on job responsibilities.

Public comment: None.

No action was taken.

15. **Hearing on Sunshine Ordinance Amendments:** Discussion regarding potential amendments to the Sunshine Ordinance and the related work of the Compliance and Amendments Committee. (05:29:10)

The Members discussed amendments to the Sunshine Ordinance regarding non-profits, and to state in the creation of bodies whether they are policy bodies and therefore subject to the Chapter 12L requirements.

Public Comment: None.

No action was taken.

16. **Announcements, Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items by Members of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.** (05:35:03)

(Note: Public Comment on this item is limited to subject matters presented by members of the SOTF.)

The Members discussed the drafting of a communication by Member Pilpel to the incoming Chief of Police expressing concerns about resources for public records and encouraging the prioritization of budgeting and management considerations to support the work. The Members also discussed inviting GovQA and NextRequest to give presentations, exploring what tools could be used to provide and maintain media communications, and the need for a database for Orders of Determination.

Public Comment: None.

17. **ADJOURNMENT** (05:41:11)

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 9:50 p.m.

Approved: 6/4/2025

Sunshine Ordinance Task Force

N.B. the Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.

#