

City and County of San Francisco



Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Education, Outreach, and Training Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place,
Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Meeting Minutes

Members: Chris Hyland (Chair), David Pilpel, Ankita Kumar

Clerk: Patricia Petersen
(415) 554-7719 ~ patricia.petersen@sfgov.org

**Tuesday, September 23,
2025**

**4:30 p.m.
Special Meeting**

City Hall, Room 408

1. **CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND AGENDA CHANGES (00:01:56)**

Chair Hyland called the meeting to order at 4:45 p.m. On the call of the roll Chair Hyland and Members Yankee and Kumar were noted present. Member Pilpel was noted absent. A quorum was present. Administrator Pat Petersen was present.

2. **Approval of the July 22, 2025, Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Education, Outreach, and Training Committee Special meeting minutes. (00:03:25)**

The members discussed amendments to the minutes.

Action: Moved by Member Yankee, seconded by Chair Hyland, to approve the minutes as amended.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 – Yankee, Hyland, Kumar

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 – Pilpel

3. **Discussion of Sunshine Questions for Future Sunshine Ordinance Training Videos.**
(00:14:31)

The members discussed possible updates and trainings pertaining to the Sunshine Ordinance including CliffNotes-type study guides, a reference page for knowledge management on the Education, Outreach, and Training Committee webpage, adding a question about active versus passive meetings, adding a slide listing the bodies that fall under the jurisdiction of the Task Force, best practices related to checking spam folders for legitimate communications, recommendations for the use of general email boxes, timely responses to immediate disclosure requests, the option to provide records on a rolling basis, how to index redactions, and what is permitted under the Sunshine Ordinance but not the California Public Records Act.

Action: Moved by Chair Hyland, seconded by Member Yankee, to continue the matter to the call of the Chair.

Public Comment: None.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 – Hyland, Yankee, Kumar

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 - Pilpel

4. **Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee’s jurisdiction but not on today’s agenda. (00:37:59)

Michael Petrelis stated his support for airing the meetings of both the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force and its Committees on SFGovTV.

5. **File No. 24007:** Complaint filed by Kevin Cantwell against the Police Department or allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to provide records in a timely and/or complete manner. (00:40:30)

Kevin Cantwell (Petitioner) stated that he made multiple requests for an incident report about his July 12, 2026 hit-and-run and was denied nearly every time from 2016 until January 3, 2023, which was exactly six years – including the 180 COVID tolling extension – when the statute of limitations on the hit-and-run expired. Mr. Cantwell further stated that the withholding of the report, without explanation, kept him from being able to hire an attorney and took away his legal recourse.

Lt. Heppler (Respondent) stated that the Incident Report Request SFPD R030242-110723 was received 11/7/2023, and an acknowledgement was sent to Complainant 11/7/2023 stating that the report is available upon verification of an ID. Lt. Heppler further stated that on 11/8/2023 the requested report was released without any redaction, that it was

emailed to Mr. Cantwell at the address provided, and that Mr. Cantwell opened and viewed the attachment on 12/18/2023.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

The parties provided rebuttals.

Action: Moved by Member Yankee, seconded by Chair Hyland, to find that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and to send the matter to the Consent Agenda with a finding of no violation.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 – Yankee, Hyland, Kumar

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 - Pilpel

6. **File No. 25033:** Complaint filed by Joudere Gaines against San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (01:07:42)

Joudere Gaines (Complainant) stated that his matter has been delayed and stalled for seven months, including delays by the Task Force Administrator due to requests for additional documents and cancellation of a hearing due to paperwork. Mr. Gaines further stated that records requests submitted to SFMTA in November 2024 have been denied without a legal statute.

Scott Edwards, Deputy Director of Parking Enforcement (Respondent) stated that Petitioner has submitted multiple and partially duplicative public records requests, and the SFMTA is not created to create records that do not exist. Mr. Edwards further stated that public data sources were sent to Petitioner along with approximately 30 responsive documents, and that multiple good faith efforts to aid the Petitioner were attempted. Mr. Edwards stated that Petitioner's concerns about the legal authority for any records that were withheld were explained.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

Chair Hyland was noted absent at 6:31 p.m. and had returned at 6:38 p.m.

The parties provided rebuttals.

Action: Moved by Member Yankee, seconded by Chair Hyland, to continue the matter and forward it to the Complaint Committee and ask that SFMTA provide a point-by-point response to each of the requests listed in NR 24-6646 located on pages 3-8 of the meeting packet.

Public Comment: Caroline Celaya stated that she is the manager of public records and that Scott Edwards is appropriate SFMTA person to respond to this complaint.

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 – Yankee, Hyland, Kumar

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 – Pilpel

7. **File No. 25037:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency and Erion Hom-Duong for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (01:59:14)

Paul Kniha (Petitioner) stated that Erion Hom-Duong activated the recording and transcription of the April 25, 2024 color curb hearing, and that his request for a copy of that transcript was denied.

Caroline Celaya (Respondent) stated that she was standing in for the staff person who responded to Request No. 25-3121 which sought transcripts of the April 25, 2024 color-curb hearing. Ms. Celaya further stated that video records have been provided to Mr. Kniha, but transcripts are currently part of the hearing process and are not required. Ms. Celaya stated that producing transcripts would require significant staff time to ensure accuracy by comparing transcripts to video records and given the availability of video recordings, the cost of producing accurate transcripts outweighs the potential benefit.

Respondent had no rebuttal. Mr. Kniha provided a rebuttal.

Action: Moved by Member Yankee, seconded by Chair Hyland, to combine Item 7 (File 25037) with Item 8 (File 25042), to find that the Task Force has jurisdiction in both matters, and to send the matters to the Consent Agenda with findings of no violation because the matters are duplicates of the matters adjudicated previously in File Nos. 24022, 24030, and 24036. Additionally, the Administrator is directed to reject as duplicative any complaints by Mr. Kniha against the SFMTA alleging complaints of text transcripts of color curb hearings.

Public Comment: none

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Yankee, Hyland, Kumar

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 - Pilpel

8. **File No. 25042:** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner.

File No. 25042 was combined with File No. 25037. Id.

9. **File No. 25053:** Complaint filed by Michael Petrelis against the Human Rights Commission, for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.29-5, by failing to respond to a request for Proposition G Calendar in a timely and/or complete manner. (02:22:22)

Michael Petrelis (Petitioner) stated that he requested the calendar of the executive director of the Human Rights Commission in June and has not received the calendar.

Devi Zinzuvadia (Respondent) conceded no contest, stated that the requested calendar available and offered to work with Mr. Petrelis to deliver a hard copy or by other means as it is too large to email .

A question-and-answer period occurred.

Ms. Zinzuvadia did not provide a rebuttal. Mr. Petrelis provided a rebuttal.

Action: Moved by Chair Hyland, seconded by Member Kumar, to find that the Task Force has jurisdiction and referred the matter to the Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find that the Human Rights Commission violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance, Section(s) 67.29-5 by failing to provide a Prop G calendar in a timely and/or complete manner. The Administrator is to confirm that the requested records have been forwarded to Mr. Petrelis at the time the matter is agendized. The Committee further requests confirmation before the matter goes to the Task Force that the records have been received or the matter will be referred to a Committee for compliance.

Respondent to cc Administrator and Committee members.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 – Hyland, Kumar, Yankee
Noes: 0 – None
Absent: 1 - Pilpel

10. **File No. 25057:** Complaint filed by Annie Gilbertson against the San Francisco Police Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, for failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. (02:42:26)

Annie Gilbertson (Petitioner) stated that she received arrest records with the Police Department's unique IDs of the arrestees redacted, and there were no accompanying citations justifying the withholding of that information. Ms. Gilbertson further stated that the records only go back 90 days, which is inconsistent with California public records law.

Member Hyland absent at 7:31 p.m. and returned at 7:35 p.m.

Lt. Heppler (Respondent) stated that per Government Code Section 7923.610 the disclosure of an ID is not required. Lt. Heppler further stated that only arrestee information contemporaneous with the request relating to persons currently within the criminal justice system is required and cited supporting case law. Lt. Heppler stated that identification numbers are not subject to public disclosure under Penal Code Section 11105.

A question-and-answer period occurred.

The parties provided rebuttals.

Action: Moved by Member Yankee, seconded by Chair Hyland, that the SOTF has jurisdiction, and refers the matter to the Task Force with a recommendation to find that the San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) violated Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.21 by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner. In addition, the Committee forwards this matter to the full Task Force to consider whether Government Code Section 7923.610 requires the production of the names of individuals arrested beyond the 90-day period provided by the SFPD. Prior to scheduling this file before the full Task Force, the Committee requests legal counsel opinion on how the court cases cited by the SFPD in their 9/18/25 letter to the Task Force interact with Government Code Section 7923.610 specifically related to contemporaneous data.

Public Comment: None

The motion **PASSED** by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 – Yankee, Hyland, Kumar
Noes: 0 – None
Absent: 1 - Pilpel

11. **File No. 25071:** Complaint filed by Wesley Saunders against the San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21(b) by failing to respond to a public records request in a timely and/or complete manner (03:11:39)

Wesley Saunders (Petitioner) stated he submitted records requests in January and April 2025, noticed that the responses did not include specific communications with target respondents whom he knew to exist, and resubmitted new requests in August with same parameters.

Ashley Summers (Respondent) stated she received Petitioner's five requests in August and undertook a search methodology that included contacting Phil Ginsburg, the individual in the request, and staff who would have had emails on this subject, and searched the Recreation and Park Commission email inbox. Contacted staff and Phil Ginsberg and Commission emails because she knew Phil had been copied on emails from the community. Ms. Summers further stated that she provided records for two of the five requests, and that all records in the departments possession have been produced.

The Committee members commended the quality, conciseness and clarity of Ms. Summers' response on behalf of Respondent.

There was no question-and-answer period.

Ms. Summers did not provide a rebuttal. Ms. Saunders provided a rebuttal.

Action: Moved by Member Kumar, seconded by Member Yankee, that the Task Force has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public, and referred the matter to the Consent Agenda with a recommendation of a finding of no violation.

Public Comment: None

Ayes: 3 – Kumar, Yankee, Hyland

Noes: 0 – None

Absent: 1 - Pilpel

12. **Announcements, Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items by Members of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Education, Outreach, and Training Committee.** (03:27;37)

The members discussed their availability for upcoming Task Force and committee meetings.

Public Comment: None

No action taken.

13. **ADJOURNMENT (03:35:47)**

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 8:21 p.m.

APPROVED: _____

**Education, Outreach, and Training Committee
Sunshine Ordinance Task Force**

N.B. the Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.

###